PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Steven Rowland, Alternate

ABSENT: Rob Duboff; Leslie Mechem

LATE ARRIVAL: Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman arrived at 7:27 P.M.

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Chris Bennett made a motion to approve the DRC Meeting Minutes of December 5, 2018 as submitted. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, abstained

MOTION PASSES: 4-0-1

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be “approvable” without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the “consent agenda” and dealt with individually.

1. 2018.111 RAYMOND WATKIN APTS. SIGN, 57 Ballston Avenue, Architectural Review of proposed monument sign within the Urban Residential-5 District.

2. 2018.112 ADIRONCACK TRUST SIGNAGE, 315 Church Street, Architectural Review of signage within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 and #2 on the consent agenda. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, made a motion in the matter of the Raymond Watkin Apartment Sign, 57 Ballston Avenue and Salvation Army signage, 27 Woodlawn Avenue, that these two applications be approved as submitted. Steven Rowland, Alternate, seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 5-0**

**C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION**

1. **2018.114 96 BALLSTON AVENUE TOWNHOMES**, 96 Ballston Avenue, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency, Architectural Review for proposed townhouse units within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated we normally defer Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board in these matters. Are there any objections from the members of the Commission? None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Ballston Avenue Townhomes, 96 Ballston Avenue that the Design Review Commission defer Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board should they wish to seek it. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 5-0**


**DISCLOSURE:**

Cynthia Corbett disclosed that Mr. Perry is working on a project for her. She has no financial interest in this application, and she can evaluate this proposal without bias.

Applicant: Mr. Palmateer, Owner & Contractor

Agent: Michael Perry, Architect

Mr. Perry stated Mr. Palmateer wishes to construct a new single family home with a two car garage on this site. Mr. Perry provided an visual presentation of the project noting proposed materials, grey asphalt shingles, black Pella windows, vinyl siding with white Azak trim. This is a pretty simple house but will add to the neighborhood.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman reminded the Commission that this project is before the DRC for architectural review and is located in the UR-5 District. The Chair asked the Commission to review the proposed use of vinyl as well as to review the mass and scale of the garage doors.

Chris Bennett stated West Avenue is becoming a gateway to the City, and the neighborhood is changing.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she also has an issue with the vinyl siding. There are a lot of interesting things happening on West Avenue with a lot of opportunity. I do not feel we should lower the bar to meet what is there we should look to the future.
Steven Rowland, Alternate stated there are many types of vinyl siding, we do not know what type the applicant is proposing. They are also proposing Azak trim.

Mr. Perry provided color samples for the home.

Cynthia Corbett stated she echoes what Leslie stated concerning the vinyl siding. That entire area is undergoing a change. A concern was noted regarding the driveway exiting on West Avenue.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if there would be any consideration for one door versus two doors on the garage doors. She feels the garage competes with the size of the primary structure and the one door may present better.

Discussion ensued regarding the massing of the garage and garage doors.

Steven Rowland, Alternate suggested the small shed roof over the garage doors could be lowered and lengthened to help mitigate the massing.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if the applicant would be agreeable to using material other than vinyl siding on this project.

Mr. Perry stated the applicant is working within a budget but he will discuss this option with him.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated fiber cement siding would be more appropriate. This is new construction going into a transitional neighborhood and it would be great to set a precedent. Also, there was any consideration to reducing the double curb cut to a single curb cut on West Avenue.

Mr. Perry stated this would need to be discussed with public works in the future.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman reviewed the Commissions suggestions. Fiber cement siding would be more appropriate for this project. Also it was suggested to lower the shed roof over the overhead doors.

Chris Bennett questioned if the applicant can provide door samples for the home and garage door and railing details.

Mr. Perry stated he is willing to return before the Commission with all the information which was requested this evening.

NOTE:
Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman joined the meeting at 7:29 P.M.

3. **2018.096 BRANT CARRIAGE HOUSE**, 695 North Broadway, Historic Review of exterior modifications to an existing accessory structure within the Urban Residential-1 District.

DISCLOSURE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated as a matter of record she recused herself from this application previously due to the proximity of her home to this property. There was no need for recusal previously and she will be participating in the discussion this evening.

Agent: Tom Frost, Frost Architecture

Mr. Frost provided an overview of the site and the project. The owner proposed the addition of four guest bedrooms in the carriage house. Two guest bedrooms with full bathrooms and 2 guest rooms for staff. This is considered an accessory structure. This is currently being used for storage and a garage. We will be gutting the building and putting the bedrooms on the second floor. The downstairs is all living space. The basic building is not changing much at all. Review of all
elevations was provided for the Commission, noting the addition of a swimming pool. There is discussion regarding re-roofing the slate roof, which is a possibility. The existing original windows are double hung, two over two and are not in good condition and will be removed and repaired and reinstalled. Double glazing will be done on all windows at this time.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman commended the architect and the owner for undertaking this project which has been in disrepair for some time. A question arose regarding the existing glass in the windows and what is being done with that glass.

Mr. Frost stated it will be removed and discarded. Some glass will be replaced with tempered glass.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the windows, glass replacements and egress issues.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated based on the conversation of the Commission this evening the thought is to repair the windows and keep the existing glass. Tempered glass to be used where mandated per code. Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned the possibility of roof replacement.

Mr. Frost stated installing a new slate roof is currently under discussion. The contractor feels it would be prudent to do so at this time.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the roof replacement.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated he agrees with the contractor. Since, the building has been unoccupied and unused for many years. Since the roof is over 150 years old and now is the time to do so. He recommends new with the reconditioning of the building.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated the Foundation has stated that they are very supportive of the adaptive reuse of this building. We are in favor of retaining the single pane glass. There are beautiful storms available. Also, the rear window in the cupola should remain round, since it is very visible from Woodlawn Avenue.

Discussion ensued regarding the retaining round glass on the cupola.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Brant Carriage House, 695 North Broadway that the application be approved with the following conditions: The existing windows will be removed and repaired. Existing windows replace glass with tempered glass in areas as required by code requirements. Maintain single paned glass in all other locations. All cupola windows to be maintained as round in shape. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 6-0

4. **2018.101 ISRAEL FAÇADE MODIFICATIONS,** 184 Spring Street, Historic Review of façade modifications (front/rear porches, windows, etc.) within the Urban Residential-3 District.

**RECUASAL:**
Commission member Chris Bennett recused from this application.
Applicant: Kasia Israel

Agent: James Ackerman, Bonacio Construction

Ms. Israel stated they have been working on this home to return it to its original beauty for about a year now. There are several modifications they have made to the original application. They have changed the trim color to White Dove. This is also going to be the color of the garage. The only changes to the exterior will be a side door entrance will be changed to a window. The window will match the windows on the home currently. Also, in the rear a sunroom was added and we are proposing to transform this area back to the open porch on the first floor, the second floor will remain.

Mr. Ackerman, Bonacio Construction stated the porch will be replaced in kind. We are proposing to change the siding to a shaker shingle the same color as the trim. The posts will match those on the front porch. The current door on the side will be replaced with a window to match current 2 over 2 wooden windows. Also the window will be framed and bricked to match those on the home currently.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman thanked the applicant for investing in their home. It is a great project.

Mr. Ackerman stated the door will be removed and the new window will be framed and bricked to match the window next to it including the arch.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman questioned if the windows will be one over one’s or two over two.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director of the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated at this point I would recommend the two over two windows. The Foundation is very supportive of this project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any other questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director of the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation questioned if the material for the rear porch was to be cedar shake shingle or cement board.

Ms. Israel stated the material will be cedar shake.

Cynthia Corbett made a motion in the matter of the Israel Façade Modification, 184 Spring Street that the application be approved as submitted or shown on the attached plans dated January 9, 2019 noting the following: Replace the door on the west façade with a window matching historic windows and historic window openings. Repair existing windows. Siding on the rear addition to be changed to cedar shake shingles. Windows will be 2 over 2 configuration.

Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-0

NOTE:
Commission member Chris Bennett resumed his position.
5. 2018.106 Cantina Rooftop, 408 Broadway, Historic Review of rooftop bar and associated structures within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Jeff Ames, owner

Agent: Dennis Rigosu, Amanda Tucker, Syvertsen Rigosu, Architects

Mr. Rigosu stated this is the second appearance before this Commission. Mr. Rigosu revisited the original design. The applicant is looking to add a rooftop bar. A new roof plan was submitted along with a review of all elevations. They have decreased the vertical height of rooftop elements including the stair tower which now has 2 windows. Material has been changed from fiber cement to brick. We have added black metal coping for the stairs and the area behind the bar. Mr. Rigosu reviewed the mechanical equipment and the revised stair tower. There is a parapet on the roof along with a railing. The railings will match belly railing on the second floor, and brick on the front of the building will be used on the visible portion of the upper floors. Mechanicals will be screened with black screening. Samples of materials were provided. Lighting will be string type of lighting.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the changes have come a long way and thanked the applicant for taking some of the Commissions suggestions.

Chris Bennett stated he likes the use of the brick and the lower height. It looks great.

Leslie DiCarlo stated the applicant has answered all of the concerns. Like the changes to the rooftop bar.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated the material made a difference and the decrease in the height helped as well. What type of floor system is being proposed?

Mr. Rigosu stated the Hanover paver system is being proposed.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she is very impressed with the changes. The railings and the piers being added gives it a new dimension and it helped bring the building back together.

Cynthia Corbett stated she feels the same as the other Commission members. She especially likes the addition of lights on the stair tower which helps decrease the perception of the height.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Alternate made a motion in the matter of the Cantina Rooftop, 408 Broadway that the application be approved as submitted as shown on the attached plans dated January 9, 2019. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

6. 2018.115 The Spa Hotel, 19 & 23 Washington Street Historic Review of new 58-room hotel and Spa within the Transect-6 Urban Core District. (final details, modifications) of a mixed-use, workforce housing development within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
Agent: Dominick Ranieri, Dominick Ranieri Architect.

Mr. Ranieri stated this project has appeared before the Commission on several occasions. We have been retained and we have addressed some of the concerns which the Commission had noted earlier such as the façade was too ominous, not a good sense of presence on the street and somewhat overpowered the historic building. We have designed a stone entrance, which would match the materials closely to the stone house and establish a scale for the courtyard opened to the public. Balconies have been added on the front of the building. Visual presentation of the project was provided to the Commission noting all elevations. We are at 65 feet to the roof with a parapet and we now have a five story building. We have dropped an entire floor. A concern was the fenestrations on the remainder of the building have been reduced or eliminated. We have added windows and Juliet balconies which overlooks the Adelphi courtyard. A grand ballroom is proposed with a capacity of 230 guests. On the other side of the building there are windows and a view of the pedestrian alley along with a grade change in this location. There will be a slight retaining wall with indirect access to the alley. The façade has been pushed back and the floor plans have been completed redone. Core spaces have been reoriented. We will engage the ground level with arches and some type of vines. Balconies will recess back in. Reviews of the floor plans were provided as well as the proposed rooms, and views. The first floor is elevated approximately 2 feet along with a ramp for handicap access. This creates a front porch with seating. Open lobby is proposed, we are in the process of discussing materials. We do want this to be an elegant space. The street transformer will be moved to an area which will be screened. The stone mansion will be preserved and additions which are not original to the building removed. This will be revamped and become a spa. Access from the hotel to the spa will be accomplished with a new connector. Brick is being suggested to match the new hotel as well as the Adelphi and Preservation Hall. Our building is proposed and begins behind the old house. Images were provided for the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a very exciting project addition to this corridor. Concerns were raised by the Preservation Foundation and SHPO as well. Correspondence was received late today from SHPO noting their concerns regarding losing the stone wall in front of the stone building. They were enthusiastic about the pocket park. The Preservation Foundation concerns were the mass and scale as well as the height of the building as well as removing the initial addition of the stone building as well. Some concerns were voiced regarding architectural style.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if the setback of the proposal allows the stone building to shine as itself. A request to review this area was posed by the Chair.

Mr. Ranieri provided a view of the area in question. It is the plan to remove the old portion of the stone building and add a new connector.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the height and mass and scale of the building. As was presented it currently stands at 65 feet to the roof.

Mr. Ranieri provided information to the Commission concerning the need for the height of the building as is presented.

Chris Bennett stated the mass looks better than the previous presentation. It does however, overshadow the stone house, almost crowd it.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she agrees with Chris the stone house looks crowded.

Steven Rowlund, Alternate requested a perspective from other views of the project.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she is struggling with the large columns on the new building in relation to the building on either side of them. Her concern is that this building is taking up so much of a character and personality and would like to see how it shows some relationship to the stone mansion and is complementary. This is more Classical type of architecture. Perhaps the connector could be glass.

Steven Rowlund, Alternate stated this is a drastic improvement over what was previously presented. One of the things he suggested is the front portion of the façade bump out further than what is presented. This will soften the appearance of the two buildings lining up.
Mr. Ranieri spoke regarding how the design was originated and why it was designed this way.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated we are early on in the process. We hope we have given you some ideas

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further thoughts from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation thanked the applicant for the great design with the Adelphi and would like to continue that moving forward. There are a couple of issues. Scale and mass is important as well as the height. SHPO described the façade as proposed is inappropriately large and monolithic, threatening to overpower the parish house and the nearby historic buildings. What are the light impacts to UPH and the stained glass windows and shadowing. This needs to be explored and researched further. The DRC as a process needs to discuss how the addition is to be evaluated further for the need to be demolished. A glass connector is a good solution. We are struggling with how this architectural style and portico and how that relates to other architectural styles or context of Washington Street and the how it meets the design guidelines. I agree ADA compliance is important and is something we would not want to sacrifice. The stone wall should not be lowered and we prefer it stay in its current location. Also 9 over 9 windows do not appear anywhere in Saratoga per se. The windows should be paired two over two’s. We are anxious to see the next iteration.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a very exciting project and the Commission looks forward to seeing the next rendering.

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, January 15, 2019 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, January 23, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 10:00 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary