



# DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

## MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 15, 2020

6:30 P.M.

RECREATION CENTER

**PRESENT:** Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Leslie Mechem; Rob DuBoff; Ellen Sheehan

**STAFF:** Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

**CALL TO ORDER:** Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 6:30 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

### **A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:**

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the December 11, 2019 DRC meeting with minor corrections. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

### **VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

### **B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **20200025 ANDERS MATTSON GOLF SIGNAGE**, 62 Excelsior Avenue, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
2. **20200024 METABOLIC SIGNAGE**, 30 Gick Road, Architectural Review of a new wall signage within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.
3. **20200027 SOUNDBAR AWNING**, 6(16) Caroline Street, Historic Review of a replacement awning within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.
4. **20200026 RUSSELL FRONT DOOR RELOCATION**, 499 Union Avenue, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
5. **20200030 ANYTIME FITNESS SIGNAGE**, 60 West Avenue, Suite 1B, Architectural Review of a new wall sign Within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Consent Agenda Items #1, #2, #3, #4 and #5. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on these applications. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Anders Mattson Golf Signage, 62 Excelsior Avenue; Metabolic Signage, 30 Gick Road; Soundbar Awning, 6 (16) Caroline Street; Russell Front Door Relocation, 499 Union Avenue; Anytime Fitness Signage, 60 West Avenue, that these applications be approved as submitted. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

**C. ANNOUNCEMENT – RELEASE OF DRAFT UNIFIED DEVELOPMENT ORDINANCE (UDO)**

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the draft of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) has been released and is available on the City's website. This is a combination of subdivision regulations, updated zoning ordinance, incorporation of construction standards, urban forest master plan, and the complete streets plan. The consultants will be available for presentations throughout the week, and it suggested the Commission members attend an information session. The public is welcome as well. Comments and suggestions are welcome. This will be reviewed, and a final draft will be submitted to the City Council.

**D. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION**

1. **2019122 FLEMING EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS & GARAGE**, 75 Ludlow Street, Historic Review of exterior changes (kitchen, north & south porch additions) and a new, detached 2-car garage within the Urban Residential-3 District.

**DISCLOSURE:**

Commission member Chris Bennett disclosed that Dr. Fleming is his dentist. He has no financial interest in this application. He feels he can be impartial in his review and voting on this application.

Agent: Tom Frost, Frost Hurff Architecture

Mr. Frost provided a model of the proposed structure for the Commission noting the proposed additions and changes to the home. The screen porch and kitchen areas will have additions along with internal renovations. A new detached 2-car garage is proposed with a small mechanical shed attached to the garage. Wood siding is proposed with a slate roof and brick to match.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding moving the mechanicals to the second floor of the 2-car garage. Removing the small shed area attached on the side of the garage. Matching the brick to the existing.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Rub DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Fleming Exterior Modifications and Garage, 75 Ludlow Street that the application be approved with the following conditions – the applicant/architect will work to reduce the size of the mechanical

room attached shed to the garage, or remove it entirely and locate mechanicals inside the building. Final details to be submitted administratively. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

2. **20190944 MOUZON HOUSE EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 1 York Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications (south façade porch extension, new east façade porch) within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Diane and David Pedinotti

Agent: Jonathan Haines, Phinney Design Partners

Mr. Haines reviewed the visual of the initial presentation. He has been working with the owners following the comments received by the Commission. They have reduced the pitch of the porch roof as well as the gazebo to avoid conflicting with the historic double hung windows. We have flipped the fireplace to the other side, the wooded side of the parcel, opening up the corner to views out to High Rock Avenue. New renderings were provided to the Commission reviewing all the elevations. All the finishes are in keeping with the current structure as we initially presented. Signage will be proposed for the parking lot side of the structure above the second-floor level which will require a variance, but this will help to define the entrance per the Commission's recommendation. We will return for signage after the applicant appears before the ZBA.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman noted that the proposed changes incorporated really enhance the final product. The proposed project works and reads much better.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the proposed changes. It was the consensus of the Commission that re-working the plans read much better and the Commission is happy with the revisions and changes.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Mouzon House Exterior Modifications, 1 York Street, that the application be approved as submitted or shown on the plans dated January 15, 2020. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

3. **20191160 LUDWIG EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 204 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review of proposed roof materials changes within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: David (Brett) Ludwig

Mr. Ludwig stated the metal roof on their newly purchased home needs to be replaced. Estimates were obtained for both

metal and shingles for cost purposes. The budget conscious analysis is metal where the shingles currently exist and shingles where the metal roof exists. We are not opposed to replacing it all in metal but would like to have the option to use shingles in some areas for budgetary reasons.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman spoke regarding the standards and guidelines when it refers to historic homes. These guidelines state repair rather than replace. If the roof needs to be replaced that it be replaced in kind. The Chair noted if the entire roof needs to be replaced for consistency purposes it should be replaced with all the same material and that would be standing seam.

Chris Bennett questioned if the entire roof was leaking.

Mr. Ludwig stated near the chimney and along the ridge in the back of the home. It comes through the attic and through the insulation and through the ceiling.

Chris Bennett questioned if structurally the roof can hold the snow load both on the main roof and side porch roof and what materials are proposed for the porch roof.

Mr. Ludwig stated the front porch would be metal as well for consistency and continuity. He is unaware of the snow load calculations.

Chris Bennett suggested the applicant choose to use a shingle roof for the front porch.

Rob DuBoff suggested the applicant paint and repair the current metal roof which is half the cost of a new roof.

Leslie DiCarlo spoke regarding the frustration of roof leaks. She believes the current roof can be worked with.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated the metal roof on this home is beautiful and compliments the house well. She is also in favor of replacing with a metal standing seam roof if it indeed needs to be replaced. She agrees the front porch roof will look better if shingled.

Leslie Mechem stated she believes if the roof can be repaired it should be repaired versus replaced. If it needs to be replaced it should be replaced with standing seam.

Ellen Sheehan also feels metal standing seam would be the most appropriate for this home.

Chris Bennett noted the small front porch roof can be shingled and the hips should have a historic cap with a low profile.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated it seems the consensus of the Commission is encouraging the applicant to repair versus replace. Should the rear portion of the lower roof be unrepairable, it should be replaced in kind. The Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation, in their correspondence regarding this project, did review the standards for major building elements in the ordinance. They recommend that the standing seam metal roof be replaced in kind to maintain the historic appearance in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities of the home as well present a consistent appearance.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Karen Cavotta made a motion in the matter of the Ludwig Exterior Modifications, 204 Lake Avenue that the application be approved with the following conditions – Repair the main roof rather than replace, especially to keep the original roof of the main house. If the lower rear roof needs to be replaced it should be replaced with standing seam. The front porch roof we recommend asphalt with a metal cap at the hip. Lower porch roof to be standing seam if replaced. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

4. **20191208 DOWNTOWNER HOTEL EXTERIOR**, 413 Broadway, Historic Review of multiple exterior changes to an existing structure within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Agent: Mike Phinney, Phinney Design Group

Mr. Phinney noted the applicant did some extensive renovations to the interior last year. They did some basic color change to the exterior along with ADA compliant ramp and lift. The building is 50's motor lodge which has had some cutesy trims and Victorian moldings which are not appropriate. We are proposing to strip that off and replace with a new monolithic design and modern look with a new design look at the corner. Main signage will match the new aesthetic as well. We are proposing removal of the awnings. Walkways are structurally failing and need replacement. These will be replaced with a poured concrete product. A new survey was provided to the Commission. The applicant is also proposing to clean and repair the brick, provide new walkways around the top and bottom. New stairway, a steel structure with a covered new roof in natural wood. The building is proposed to be in a dark color with natural pops of wood as an accent. We are looking to define the main entry. The existing windows and trim will remain in place. The bricks need to be repointed and painted a dark color. Some examples of paint colors were provided to the Commission as well as views of the current site. A review of the proposed awnings and planters and lpe siding rain screen were also provided. An example of the proposed signage was presented to the Board which needs to be finalized at a later date.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman requested some additional information regarding the lpe siding rain screen.

Mr. Phinney explained how the system is installed to the brick.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation has provided comments on this project. The Foundation expressed appreciation for the significant investment the owner is making into the building. They noted some concerns regarding the painting of the brick, the color, and some questions about the lpe siding rain screen.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she feels this is a great project and happy to see this moving forward. The Chair voiced concern about the red brick wall which surrounds the property and if that is to remain brick.

Mr. Phinney stated the brick wall has been abused. They are retaining it and proposing to paint that as well.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman voiced concerns in this regard and stated it is the only thing saving the property from being a terrible eyesore.

Chris Bennett stated this is a fantastic project. The color of the brick either black or grey may lose some of the depth in the railings.

Rob DuBoff stated he agrees with Chris it is a great project, but the applicant may prefer to go with a grey color and not black. It will look great. Material choices are great. He also has concerns regarding the painting of the wall surround.

Leslie DiCarlo likes the project but has some concern regarding the choice of black as a paint color. It's a great project.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman questioned the color of the windows and screening of mechanical air conditioning units.

Leslie Mechem loves the look of the building and the proposed changes on this corner.

Ellen Sheehan stated the project is great, she voiced concerns regarding the size of the steel support posts and the covered stairs.

It was the consensus of the Commission that this is a great project and a long time coming.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman voiced concerns regarding the painting of the brick surround wall. The Chair suggested the applicant leave the brick wall as is for now and revisit this once the project has been completed.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the brick surround wall surround. Final approval for the screening elements and samples of paint color can be approved administratively.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Ellen Sheehan made a motion in the matter of the Downtowner Hotel Exterior, 413 Broadway that the application be approved with the following conditions – the applicant will defer painting the corner wall on Division Street and Broadway. Screening for condensing units and paint color sample to be submitted for administrative approval. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

5. **20191266 BANK OF AMERICA PARKING HUT**, 27 Division Street, Architectural Review of a proposed parking hut within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Bank of America

Agent: Coral Silsbe

Ms. Silsbe stated they are proposing the construction of a guard shack at the Bank of America site on 27 Division Street. A visual of the location of the guard shack was provided to the Commission. The guard shack is a small area utilized to provide better parking service for the clientele. The hut is proposed to have brick on the lower portion of the structure windows with mullions in a matte black color, an expanded metal roof in a matte black finish.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the structure is quaint. She suggested omitting the use of brick on the lower portion and keep the same element on both the top and bottom of the structure.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the use of the left image as presented as a perfectly acceptable choice for the structure.

Rob DuBoff questioned if power were to be installed in the hut.

Ms. Silsbe stated the unit will have heat and air conditioning provided. The units are provided in the upper portion of the structure. There will be no exterior penetrations.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Bank of America Parking Hut, 27 Division Street, that the application be approved with the following condition – the applicant has approval to use the left image as presented to the Commission for the building hut. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

6. **20191266 BANK OF AMERICA ROOF REPLACEMENT**, 27 Division Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications (roof replacement) within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Bank of America

Agent: Coral Silsbe

Ms. Silsbe stated the current roof is not a slate roof. It is a slate simulated tile which contains asbestos and needs to be remediated. The roof has significant damage with tiles disintegrating in place. Photographs were provided to the Commission. A copy of the roof survey was also provided to the Commission. The roof does not have a great slope and is not very visible from the street. We are proposing an asphalt roof with a slate look alike. Examples were provided to the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated in terms of replacement the material proposed the Architectural shingle proposed is acceptable and appropriate.

Chris Bennett stated a metal cap to match or copper on the ridgeline and the hips would be great.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Bank of America Parking Hut, 27 Division Street, that the application be approved with the following condition – the applicant use a metal cap to match or copper on the ridge line and hips. Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

7. **20190767 STATION LANE (ASKEW) APARTMENTS**, Station Lane, Architectural Review of a new 3-building, 39-unit apartment complex within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: Richard Askew

Agent: Derek Gribulis, Cotler Architecture

Mr. Gribulis reviewed the evolution of the project for the Commission. A visual presentation of the site was provided. Three apartment buildings are proposed. Building A – 12 units; Building B – 11 units and Building C – 6 units totaling 29 units. The buildings are three stories in height. At the previous appearance before the Commission we have changed the brick out for a culture stone and revised siding from vinyl to fiber cement. We have re-designed and updated the plans following our last appearance before the Commission taking into consideration the comments and feedback we received. We are reviewing the changes to only Building A for this meeting. The roof pitch has been decreased to make them feel

less imposing. We studied the architecture of the surrounding buildings and have incorporated some timber features from the train station and other projects in the area. We incorporated a large timber feature at the entrance into the building and we pulled out the front of the building to create more balconies to create more architectural features and making this the focal point. We pulled the porches out a bit on the corner and created a faux entrance to those as well giving it a more town home feel. We carved out some seating areas between the three entrances. These are basically the changes and we did send an email and we are requesting information concerning the zoning of these building to be two feet on grade. We are proposing to keep them at grade to make them accessible and ease of entrance to the buildings.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a vast improvement. She appreciates the applicant incorporating the feedback which was provided and to see the results creatively incorporated is a great improvement. She likes the new entrance being more prominent and the timber really speaks to the Adirondack feel and ties into the railroad depot station. The change in the pillars on the side reads better. In terms of the elevation and bringing the building up two feet, some of the reduction in the stonework mitigates that aesthetically. She still feels the front door themselves should be elevated would give a better feel.

Chris Bennett stated he agrees with the Chair. Emphasizing the entrances has made a huge difference but changing the main door in size or the addition of a transom and elevation would provide a greater emphasis on the entrance. He voiced concern regarding the decking materials.

Rob DuBoff stated he feels if it is possible to incorporate a third entrance for ADA compliance and raising the building up two feet would give the building more prominence. Also, the windows if they could be enlarged would make a big difference. You may want to look at some Italianate features you have on the building, there are several architectural styles on the structure competing with each other. Perhaps some cohesion in this instance would help.

Leslie DiCarlo stated lifting the building above the ground a bit would be helpful. She appreciates the front entrance changes. If the front door were raised and articulated better would suggest a stronger main entrance. She feels the design needs to be simplified.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman appreciates the changes that were made to this design. It is starting to take on a town home feel. This is starting to engage the street more. The small patio walls add another level. It is feeling more like a residential building. It has come a long way.

Leslie Mechem stated it does appear you have a lot of blank space between the smaller upper windows. Perhaps a trim would make a difference. The upper roofs of the end porches the white seems glaring. Overall it is an improvement especially the central portion defines the building.

Ellen Sheehan stated it is a big improvement. She feels very strongly that the building needs to be lifted. It feels top heavy and that is into the ground a bit. She agrees with Rob and the kitchen windows and the Italianate details are not in keeping with remainder of the building.

Mr. Gribulis stated the gables on the building will be metal.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated in summary look at some options for raising the building, and the third entrance, the areas where the kitchen windows are located, emphasize the entry door.

Chris Bennett stated for him it is all about the materials.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development spoke regarding how the Commission would like to proceed. This project has three buildings. Would the Commission prefer to continue to focus on Building A and then proceed with the other buildings?

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Commission has provided some additional feedback regarding the raising of the building, the front entrance doors and experimenting with the areas around the kitchen windows and materials.



Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding how to proceed with approvals for this project. It was the consensus of the Commission to focus and complete the review of Building A, and then proceed with the other buildings.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman reviewed the areas where the Commission still has concerns. The possibility of raising the building, emphasis on the entry doors, ceilings, materials, options for the windows in the front piers or adding a trim, losing some details to make it more cohesive with the Adirondack theme.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated we look forward to seeing the applicant at a future meeting.

**COMMENTS FROM STAFF:**

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development provided information to the Commission regarding the upcoming workshops for the Unified Development Ordinance noting dates and times. These workshops which will be held to review the proposed draft. The Commission can then review the areas which directly pertain to the DRC at our workshop and provide information and thoughts regarding the draft. This information can then be relayed to the consultants for a final copy.

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**

Design Review Commission Caravan, Wednesday, January 29, 2020 at 4:00 P.M.

Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, February 5, 2020 at 6:30 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:30 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski  
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 2-5-20