DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 23, 2019
7:00 P.M.
RECREATION CENTER

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Leslie Mechem; Steven Rowland, Alternate

ABSENT: Rob Duboff

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. ELECTION OF OFFICERS:


VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Robert West, alternate, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

B. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Approval of meeting minutes was deferred to the February 6, 2019 meeting of the Design Review Commission.

C. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. 20190033 STEVENS ROOF, 172 Circular Street, Historical Review of re-roofing project from asphalt to slate within the Urban Residential-1 District.

2. 2018.113 WHOLE HARVEST CO. AWNING SIGNAGE, 5 Caroline Street, Historic Review of awning signage within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

3. 20190056 ST. PAUL'S LUTHERAN CHURCH SIGNAGE, 149 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review of brick monument signage within the Urban Residential-3 District.

4. 20190058 WINSUPPLY SIGNAGE, 5 Finley Street, Architectural Review of wall signage within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #4 on the consent agenda. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Stevens Roof, 172 Circular Street, Whole Harvest Company Awning Signage, 5 Caroline Street, St Paul’s Lutheran Church Signage, 149 Lake Avenue and WinSupply Signage, 5 Finley Street, that these four applications be approved as submitted. Steven Rowland, Alternate seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Karen Cavotta, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 7-0

D. **DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION**

1. **20190040 FOX RESIDENCE DRIVEWAY,** 217 Caroline Street, Historic Review of driveway materials modification within the Urban Residential-3 District.

   Applicant: Kurt Fox, owner

   Mr. Fox provided a visual presentation of his neighborhood and what currently exists with regard to driveway materials and sidewalk materials.

   Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Commission has two determination which need to be made this evening. One regarding the sidewalk and two, appropriate materials for the sidewalk.

   Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the Commission’s jurisdiction in the Historic District.

   Chris Bennett stated our jurisdiction consists of following our historic guidelines for materials in the driveway and sidewalks. No paving over the sidewalks is paramount.

   Leslie DiCarlo spoke regarding sidewalk materials and agrees with Chris. It is important that the sidewalk maintains the correct width and correct materials.

   Steven Rowland, Alternate stated it would be most appropriate for this application to have the sidewalk be contiguous. all the way through and bisect the driveway.

   Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she agrees with the lack consistency in terms of the neighborhood driveways. It should not be setting a standard that we adhere to. I feel that because other homeowners have made mistakes in judgment or inadvertently it shouldn’t entitle other homeowners to make the same mistake.

   Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman agrees with most of the Commission. She also feels that there should be a consistent walkway for pedestrians. This neighborhood looks like this is more the norm.

   Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development spoke regarding the City’s guidelines.

   Leslie Mechem spoke regarding the herringbone brick and if there was a substantial amount left then it might make sense to continue the brick. If not then poured concrete to complete the sidewalk would be in order.

   Cynthia Corbett stated extending the brick herringbone would be great.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Commission is all in agreement that the sidewalk needs to cross the driveway. I think it should be replaced with herringbone.

Chris Bennett stated the herringbone would need to be removed re-leveled and re-laid. The applicant wants to replace the area with concrete to the property line.

Steven Rowland, Alternate stated the applicant wants to replace the area with concrete to the property line. The area of herringbone sidewalk is minimal compared to the remainder of the sidewalk.

Cynthia Corbett questioned if the applicant could save the bricks from the sidewalk for some future project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Chris Bennett made a motion in the matter of the Fox Residence Driveway, 217 Caroline Street that we approved with the following conditions – The asphalt in front of the driveway is to be removed and replaced with a new concrete sidewalk to match the concrete which currently exists. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Karen Cavota, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

2. 2018.110 PALMATEER RESIDENCE, 303 West Avenue, Architectural Review for a new single-family residence within the Urban Residential-5 District.

DISCLOSURE:
Cynthia Corbett disclosed that Mr. Perry is working on a project for her. She has no financial interest in this application, and she can evaluate this proposal without bias.

Applicant: Mr. Palmateer, Owner & Contractor
Agent: Michael Perry, Architect

Mr. Perry stated at his last appearance before the Commission there were several issues which needed further clarification. These included the type of siding proposed, garage doors and the shed roof over the garage doors. Mr. Perry stated the applicant has no issues with using the Hardie Board siding. Mr. Perry provided material samples to the Commission, as well as cut sheets for the doors, windows and roofing materials. A photograph of the proposed garage door was provided as well. Larger brackets are proposed over the garage doors with a larger shed roof to help break up the mass of the garage doors.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Cynthia Corbett made a motion in the matter of the Palmateer Residence, 303 West Avenue that the application be approved with the following conditions – Larger brackets over the garage doors shown on plans submitted this date. Hardie Board siding as presented this date. Garage doors to be approved administratively. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.
VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Karen Cavotta, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

3. 2018.118 IZZO RESIDENCE, 105 Church Street, Architectural Review of addition reconstruction within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Agent: Marcella Gooda, Harlan-McGee Architects

Ms. Gooda stated this is an older home built approximately in the 1800’s. A tree fell on the rear addition portion of the home. A visual of the home site was provided to the Commission. The applicant will remove the materials which currently exist in this area and try to re-attach to the home on both levels. We are attempting to enclose the area to install new windows, siding materials to be white vinyl.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this home is located in an architectural district but the home itself is historic. This addition has never been a defining feature of the home. The Commission will be discussing the use of vinyl versus a different cladding material.

Cynthia Corbett stated this home is a beautiful example of the period. There is a historic plaque in front of this home. The applicant should use the best materials they can, either cement board siding or wood materials. The use of 6 over 6 windows would also not be an accurate representation. The use of 2 over 2 would echo the historic nature of the home or 1 over 1.

Chris Bennett stated the use of 1 over 1 windows would be preferable, as well as wood or cement board siding which can be painted. Cement Board would be more appropriate than vinyl.

Leslie Mechem stated she agrees cement board or non vinyl siding would be better given the historic nature of the home and the area in which it is located.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she agrees with the Commission concerning the cement board siding and the windows.

Leslie DiCarlo questioned the shed roof over the rear stairs.

Discussion ensued regarding the roofing in this area.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Steven Rowland, Alternate made a motion in the matter of the Izzo Residence, 105 Church Street, that the application be approved with the following conditions – New windows are to be 1 over 1 double hung. Fiber cement siding in lieu of vinyl. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Karen Cavotta, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

Agent: Brett Balzer, Balzer Tuck Architects

Mr. Balzer stated the Commission is familiar with this property. We are speaking tonight about the existing outbuilding on the northwest corner of the site which is not occupied. We will be creating a photo building for Saratoga Honda to use for internet sales as well as installing an additional detailing bay. The building currently exists and it is approximately 1,000 square feet which will complement the new building. We are proposing no additional pavement, sidewalks or landscaping. On the west side of the building will be the additional bay. Visual presentation of the two overhead doors and elevations were provided to the Commission. The two doors which currently exist on the building will remain. The brick will be patched and repaired to accommodate the changes. The remainder of the building will be painted and a new roof will be added. Proposed lighting for the building was reviewed as well as the new roof color. This will be a simple clean building.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a very utilitarian building.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the project and the materials noting the building will look better than it does currently.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion by the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Saratoga Honda Outbuilding, 3402 US Rte 9, that the application be approved as submitted. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Karen Cavotta, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 7-0


Agent: Kailyn Korey, LA Group

Ms. Korey stated the applicant is proposing a 13 x 40 foot pergola to the back side of the Raymond Watkin Apartment Building. The owner of the building is refreshing the property, additional landscaping and patio refurbishing. He is proposing the addition of tables and chairs in this seating area under the pergola which will provide some shade and a nice area for the tenants to use. It is simple Azak Clad structural aluminum trellis which will be attached to the building in the rear. This will not be seen from the road. A visual presentation of what the applicant is proposing was provided to the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie DiCarlo made a motion in the matter of the Raymond Watkin Apartment Trellis, 57 Ballston Avenue that the The application be approved as submitted or shown on the attached plans. Steven Rowland, Alternate seconded the motion.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Karen Cavotta, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 7-0

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**
Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, January 29, 2019 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, February 6, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**
There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:08 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 2-6-19