PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie DiCarlo; Chris Bennett; Leslie Mechem; Rob DuBoff

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Chris Bennett made a motion to approve the minutes of the January 9, 2019 DRC meeting as submitted. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, abstained; Bob DuBoff, abstained

MOTION PASSES: 5-0-2

Chris Bennett made a motion to approve the minutes of the January 23, 2019 DRC meeting as submitted. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, abstained; Bob DuBoff, abstained

MOTION PASSES: 6-0-1

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be “approvable” without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the “consent agenda” and dealt with individually.

1. **20190085 BROADWAY AWNINGS**, 493 Broadway, Historic Review of new awning canvas within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

2. **20190086 SNIDER FASHIONS**, 18 Congress Street, Architectural Review of wall signage within The Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on the consent agenda items #1 and #2. None heard.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the 493 Broadway Awnings, 493 Broadway, and Snider Fashions, 18 Congress Street, wall sign that these applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Bob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

D. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

1. 20190030 FALVEY MIXED-USE BUILDING, 65 Beekman Street consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency status (architectural review) for a new 2-story, mixed-use building within the Neighborhood Complementary Use-1District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a procedural application. We normally defer Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board in these matters. Are there any objections from the members of the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Falvey Mixed Use Building, 65 Beekman Street, that the Design Review Commission defer Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board should they wish to seek it. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Bob DuBoff, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

2. 20190073 SPA CAFÉ VENT, 480-494 Broadway, Historic Review of façade modification (exterior Ventilation equipment) within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Agent: Darren Palmetto

Mr. Palmetto stated the applicant is seeking approval to install an exhaust vent up to the roof and culminate in a stainless steel mushroom fan. Mr. Palmetto provided information on the installation of the venting materials and construction with the approval of the Building Department. The duct work will be painted to match the building.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is fairly straightforward application. Any further questions or comments from the Commission.

Rob Duboff questioned the mounting of the venting to the building.

Mr. Palmetto stated the venting will be mounted to the brick using strapping.

Chris Bennett stated this Commission prefers the venting be attached to the mortar joints not the bricks. The mortar can be repaired.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Spa Cafe Vents, 480-494 Broadway, that the application be approved with the following condition – That the straps for the venting be attached to the mortar joints not the brick. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

3. **20190068 WATKINS CARPORT/FAÇADE MODIFICATION**, 153 Union Avenue, Historic Review of Carport demolition and side entrance reconstruction within the Urban Residential-4 District.

**RECUSAL:**

Leslie DiCarlo recused from this application.

Applicant: William Watkins

Mr. Watkins stated he is proposing removal of the existing carport. The stone wall will be removed and he will be re-creating columns, using wainscoting and all wood products to rebuild the side façade of the home to match the existing porch. They are hoping to return this home back to its original form. Mr. Watkins stated he has been in contact with the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. Mr. Watkins provided a visual of the proposed project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman commended the applicant for renovating this historic home using the proper materials.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

**Samantha Bosshart,** Executive Director of the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation thanked the applicant for taking the time to meet with them and the Foundation feels this is a great project. We believe it will improve the appearance of the home. Thank you for your investment.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if the applicant is proposing any lighting, if so cut sheets would be required.

Mr. Watkins stated no lighting is proposed at this time.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Watkins Carport, Façade Modification, 153 Union Avenue that the application be approved with the following conditions – all materials, details and sizes to match existing porch as described this evening. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

Commission member Leslie DiCarlo resumed her position on the Commission.

4. **2018.103 VARLEY BUILDING FAÇADE**, 378 Broadway, Historic Review of building façade modifications, within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Ryan Berry

Mr. Berry stated the applicant is moving his office to the area which currently houses a juice bar. Drawings are
currently in process. The applicant is working with the City and the Preservation Foundation to repair the façade of the building. The applicant's intent is to replace the storefront windows and doors across the front of the building with a black metal floor to ceiling window matching the stone on the front of the sills. The brick on the building is currently painted blue and we are proposing to paint it a dark maroon which is more historic in nature and matches his sign and the windows. The awning and box signs on the drawing are not allowed. We will be putting the sign on the brick of the building. The building is disjointed and will be consistent with a more historic look.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated a letter was submitted from the Preservation Foundation. The Foundation appreciates that the applicant took into consideration many of their suggestions and incorporated them into the plans. The Foundation approves the plans with the following exception – one being the awning with the illuminated signage which is not part of the application this evening.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman questioned the existing blue area if it will be removed and was it original to the building.

Mr. Berry stated the blue area will be removed it is not original to the building.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning materials and small details of the project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she appreciates the efforts of the applicant. This is a good project tastefully done. Also, the Chair requested a sample of the paint color of the building. This can be approved administratively.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

**Samantha Bosshart**, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated she met with Ryan and the project changed for the better in keeping with the historic design. It is a great building and this will definitely improve it aesthetically. Thank you to the owner for investing in his building.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Varley Building Façade Modification, 378 Broadway, that the application be approved with the following condition – a color sample of paint to be submitted and approved administratively. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 7-0

5. **2018.083 THE FIVE THREE MIXED-USE BUILDING,** 53 Putnam Street, Sketch Plan review (Historic Review) of a mixed-use building within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Applicant: Fairfield Associates

Agent: David D'Amour A&D Architecture & Design

Mr. D'Amour stated we last appeared before the Commission several months ago. We have taken the feedback we received from the Commission in December and have returned before you with a presentation which is very similar to what was seen in December. The 6 story building proposal was not viable so we are going with a 4 story building well below the 70ft. threshold for this district. We propose to continue to provide access to the rooftop. So the stairs and the tower would
project above the four story. We have modified the street elevation to demonstrate how that street elevation change affects the streetscape and becomes more comfortable. Floor plans have evolved and were submitted to the Commission. This floor plan is largely the same with an eating establishment on the 1st floor. We have basically taken the 15 foot setback and bumped it out to the sidewalk. In doing so, in this floor plan, we have kept the elevator and stair tower the same. The upper floors are largely the same. We are still discussing condos versus apartments. We are working with a darker color palette. We are using similar types of features that you would see downtown such as corbels, top of the store front to distinguish between the first and upper floors and some stone work. Views of all elevations were provided to the Commission. Residential floors basically remain the same except we have added balconies on the south side. If we add a 5th floor stepped back we can add 7 additional units as well as a rooftop terrace with a pergola which faces out to the face of the building with some additional amenities such as fire pits and grills. View of the 5 story building was provided noting the mass and scale is compatible with what surrounds it.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman thanked the applicant for the overview. The Chair stated she is encouraged to see the applicant has incorporated some of the feedback the Commission provided into the revised sketch plan. This is a sketch plan discussion. The Commission can provide some ideas on mass and scale. The fourth floor versus the fifth floor and provide the applicant with some guidelines concerning materials. One comment which jumps out is the pergola draws the eye up and we are trying to reduce the height.

Cynthia Corbett stated she agrees with Tamie concerning the pergola. Also, 4 stories would be better. A fifth floor with rooftop amenities and a stair and elevator tower bring this back to a 6 story building. Also, she questions the civic space.

Leslie Mechem also agrees that the pergola fights against the mass of the building.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated the pergola is a little overwhelming. Emphasizing the entrance and further exploring the façade would be good. I tended toward the 5th story stepped back, with the wing portions of the building. The rooftop amenities should be placed more towards the rear of the building. The balconies are nice and help reduce the size of the building. Natural materials and wood elements would be nice.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she agrees with the pergola. I am not against the 5th story with it stepped back, but I don’t want it to be higher than that. She likes the façade and the applicant is moving in the right direction.

Rob DuBoff agrees with Leslie DiCarlo. The main storefront does not have a defined real entry. The entry flush with the front façade of the building will provide a better defined entryway. It will also provide an airlock for the restaurant and the patrons dining there. A better defined entryway was my concern. I do like the mullion pattern on the windows and the front façade. Regarding the broken cornice, would you consider not breaking it? Also I would be in agreement with the fifth floor if the stair tower and elevator tower were removed.

Mr. D’Amour provided information concerning the design in the cornice and his reasoning for doing this.

Jim Riggs stated thank you we are making some headway. We tried to move the building back per the Commission’s request. We are trying to add more amenities for the tenants.

Chris Bennett is stated the fifth story is appropriate and adds visual interest to the building. Overall the products you are proposing are intriguing. Overall you are heading in the right direction.

Material samples were provided to the Board. Brick samples and tile panels in several colors.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the juxtaposition of materials on the new building are very appropriate. We are tasked by the city to look at proposals such as this to determine if the mass and scale are appropriate, whether the materials are appropriate for the neighborhood architecturally and historically. While we may be leaning towards a 5th floor stepped back providing amenities for the tenants will fall on the applicant’s shoulders. Some comments made this evening about the pergola and the stairwell so it does not pop up like a 6th floor. Comments on the entranceway and how to emphasize that.
The objective would be reducing the appearance of height. A white 5th floor draws the eye. A darker color would be more appropriate. A lot of brick in the neighborhood; you might want to pick up on that.

Rob DuBoff stated he likes the glass panels and balusters, and how you treat the first floor to help break up the mass.

Chris Bennett stated he would like to see some emphasis on the front entrance which is important.

Mr. D'Amour stated they will be focusing on the 5th floor concept and reworking the pergola concept.

Discussion ensued regarding the materials proposed and providing the Commission with some examples of the proposed material products.

Mr. D'Amour stated they will be choosing lighting and other fixtures for the building as well as examples of the proposed brick and building materials for the Commission to review. This will be provided to the Board.

Tamie Ehinger questioned the applicant with regard to the addition of a 5th floor, will the stair tower and elevator tower be on top of the 5th floor.

Mr. D'Amour stated there is a parapet around the roof which will disguise the stair and elevator tower somewhat. It will still project over the parapet about 6 or 7 feet at the rear of the building. Mechanicals will be hidden by the parapet wall with fireplaces venting slightly above the parapet wall.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application.

Samantha Bosshart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation thanked Dave as well as the owners for the dialog they have had. We supported the 5th floor as it was presented. We would not have supported this rendering as presented. What we liked about the previous version, the 5th floor versus the 4th floor was the uniformity and not having the large stair towers visible. What this does is eliminate all of what we liked in the previous iterations. We would not support this rendering. We are open to contemporary materials. The fenestrations still need some work. We look forward to seeing this move forward. We are appreciative of the height being lowered.

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**

Design Review Caravan, Tuesday, February 12, 2019 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, February 20, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:55 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 2-20-19