



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2019

7:00 P.M.

RECREATION CENTER

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Chris Bennett; Leslie DiCarlo; Leslie Mechem; Rob DuBoff; Ellen Sheehan

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:02 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Approval of the meeting minutes was deferred to the September 18, 2019 meeting of the Design Review Commission.

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be “approvable” without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the “consent agenda” and dealt with individually.

1. **20190812 METABOLIC SIGNAGE**, 30 Gick Road, Architectural Review of (2) wall signs within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.
2. **20190856 AIROSMITH SIGNAGE**, 318 West Avenue, Architectural Review of wall signage within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.
3. **20190876 NATIONAL MUSEUM OF RACING EXTERIOR**, 191 Union Avenue, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Institutional-Horse Track-Related District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on items #1-#3. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on these applications. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Metabolic Signage, 30 Gick Road, Airosmith Signage, 318 West Avenue, and the National Museum of Racing Exterior, 191 Union Avenue that these applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

- 4. 20190770 ALLENDALE SUPPORTIVE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT**, 40 & 42 Allen Drive, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency (Architectural Review) for supportive housing apartments and workforce training center within the Urban Residential-4 and Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood Districts.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a procedural item and is for consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency for the Allendale Supportive Housing apartments and workforce training center within the Urban Residential-4 and Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood Districts. Typically the DRC defers Lead Agency status to the Planning Board in these matters.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any objection from the Commission regarding this deferral. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Allendale Supportive Housing Development, 40 & 42 Allen Drive, the Design Review Commission defers Lead Agency Status for SEQRA to the Planning Board should they choose to accept it. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor;

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

RECUSAL:

Leslie DiCarlo recused from the following application.

- 5. 20190820 181 PHILA STREET EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 181 Phila Street, Historic Review of exterior modifications with the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Marc Paquin, Owner

Mr. Paquin stated they just acquired this property and are in the process of finalizing the plans to restore the building to its original construction and design. Mr. Paquin provided background of the property along with a visual presentation. We are planning to restore this mansion. Mr. Paquin stated they plan on replacing the asphalt shingle roof, removing the skylights, repointing and repainting the chimney with new caps, removal of a bay window and replacement of the corbel ends and rafters to match existing on the west roof line which was reconfigured to accommodate the window. In its place we will replace with a window which would have been there originally. All damaged clapboard sheatin will be restored, and repaired back to what was original to the building. We will repaint the home a blue color which was found under the current clapboard. The wrap around porch will be repaired and replaced and restored. We will meet the code with the risers, railings and stairs. We will re-use what materials we are able to salvage and have others constructed to match. We will add period lighting to the house along with several ceiling fans on the porch. The front entrance doors are original to the home and we are proposing to remove the paint and restore them to the original wood. Regarding the windows, we are planning on repairing and restoring all existing frames and sashes to the windows. The stained glass and leaded windows are original to the home and will remain. All the windows will be 1 over 1 double hung windows. We are requesting a 6 over 1 configuration since there are few architectural elements on this large home. We will also repair all the existing shutters and replace missing shutters with custom manufactured shutters to match the existing. There are some vinyl windows on the three story addition as well as on the north side. We would like to replace with the same type of windows since there are structural issues on this side. The garage is non-descript and does not fit with the neighborhood or home. We are proposing adding some architectural elements to make it fit with the neighborhood. We will replace the garage doors and the man door as well as lighting to match the house. The sunroom was constructed originally as an open porch and was at sometime modified. We would like to keep the appearance the same and infill with fixed panes with several casement

windows and some minor repairs. There are plans to cover the entrance to the home and the basement stairs due to issues with water and snow sheeting in this area. The applicant explained a type of roof in this area to help with protection from the weather which mimics the detail from the carriage house. They are proposing removal of the sliding glass door and replace with a french door with a transom for additional lighting in the kitchen. The deck area will be an item for discussion at a different time and is not included in this application.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is really an impressive amount of work being proposed to restore this home which is a contributing home in the historic district but it also has really stood out over the years as one of Saratoga's homes that stands out. Its an extensive expansive home and one of the city's pride and joys. I commend you for the vast amount of work being done on this home. It seems very clear you are respecting and embellishing everything on this home that makes it historic. Replacing in kind and the amount of work being done is very admirable. The Chair noted several concerns as well as some comments from the Saratoga Preservation Foundation. Changing window configurations is not something we would want done to a historic home. You mentioned changing the one over one to a six over one for aesthetic reasons but it would be inappropriate for the work being done here. The changes to the north elevation make sense and is a good solution to a problem. The sunroom changes work and work well. The vinyl windows which are being removed and replaced are a concern. All of the original windows being repaired and replaced is wonderful. We would require some further documentation concerning the windows for our records, it is what we have requested traditionally.

Mr. Pacquin stated he has some documentation and information with him this evening. He noted we are replacing the vinyl windows with wood windows. Window documentation was provided to the Commission.

Chris Bennett stated this is a wonderful project. His main concern are the windows. He would encourage the use of all wood windows, they look better than vinyl, it reads softer and is more historic. As a whole he has no problems with the project.

Rob DuBoff stated he agrees with Chris. A wood replacement window with a one over one or two over two would be most appropriate. He also questioned what materials are proposed for the porch.

Mr. Paquin provided information concerning some of the original woodwork which is in good condition will be saved and resued. All materials will be wood.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman state she would like to see more detailed information on the porch deck that is to be created.

Mr. Paquin stated the back porch deck is not to be included in this application. The applicant will return with those details and a landscaping plan at a future time.

Leslie Mechem stated this is a wonderful project. The addition of the shutters to the windows will provide enough of an architectural element so the one over one or two over two windows will be not only adequate but appropriate providing enough of a detail.

Ellen Sheehan stated it is wonderful and a tremendous improvement to the neighborhood and the city.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Commission is in agreement with historically appropriate rather than the applicants proposed six over six windows. One over one is most appropriate as well as wood replacement versus an aluminum clad. The back deck is to be excluded from tonight's application. The applicant will provide window documentation to the Commission for the record. Fiberglass garage doors versus metal are proposed.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of 181 Phila Street Exterior Modifications, 181 Phila Street that the application be approved with the following conditions – 1 over 1 wood non-clad windows. The back deck is excluded from the application. Fiberglass doors for the carriage house. The applicant has the option to replace clapboard siding with wood shingles to match historic photo as submitted by the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

Leslie DiCarlo resumed her position on the Commission.

- 6. 20190775 58-60 BEEKMAN STREET EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 58-60 Beekman Street, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Neighborhood Complementary Use-1 District.**

Applicant: Rob Rothschild

Agent: Peter Loyola, CLA Site

Mr. Loyola provided some history of the project for the Commission noting the applicant purchased the property in 1989 thinking it was a 4 unit building. When he attempted to sell the property in the spring it was determined it was only zoned for three units building. We met with City Staff and it was discovered the zoning was changed to NCU-1 which allowed a commercial unit. The Planning Board issued a Special Use Permit and recommended we appear before the DRC to review some of the repairs previously completed on the site. The applicant vinyl sided the building, new windows were installed and new front stairs and railings were added. 8 parking spaces are provided behind the building. A shed was removed and a bilco door was replaced with a new bilco door. There have been no changes made to what we have presented. We are to return to the Planning Board for Site Plan Review.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated this is a unique circumstance. The Commission should review this as an application. It should be noted that the DRC began to have jurisdiction following the zoning change to NCU-1 in 2004. Many improvements would have been done prior to that date.

Mr. Loyola stated the buyer is intent on keeping the current tenants in place. They are long term tenants.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated this is consent of current conditions, for what is there. All repairs and changes were well before 2004 and a timeline was provided.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman provided the following – the direction the Commission takes on this is due to the fact that all work on the existing property was done prior to zoning changes we have no objection as to how it stands now. As a result of that we encourage and future changes will subject to the DRC review and design guidelines.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wish to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie DiCarlo made a motion in the matter of the 58-60 Beekman Street Exterior Modifications, 58-60 Beekman Street that the application be approved with the following conditions – as a result of work being completed prior to being under the jurisdiction of the DRC, we have no objection to the current conditions. However, future changes will be subject to DRC review and will be subject to current DRC guidelines. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

7. **20190784 3246 SOUTH BROADWAY EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 3246 South Broadway, Architectural Review of exterior modifications within the Rural Residential/Tourist Related Business District.

Agent: Timothy Wade, Verdant Architecture

Mr. Wade stated he is representing the applicants for the property located at 3246 South Broadway. The building is currently unoccupied and they are seeking out a tenant for the site. The applicant is proposing to improve the outside of the building. Generally, they will leave the main building but perform cosmetic improvements and face lifts. This will involve painting, removing some of the brick facades, redoing the windows on the west side of the building as well as extended canopies and fresh materials and nicer colors. A review of all elevations was provided for the Commission. This will involve removal of some old materials and replace with nicer materials around the entire building, new canopies and replace under the soffits with bleached stained wood.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this seems like a very straightforward application.

Discussion ensued among the Board regarding canopies and proposed materials.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion of in the matter of 3246 South Broadway Exterior Modifications, 3246 South Broadway that the application be approved as submitted. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

8. **20190836 CHILD TIME SIGNAGE**, 7 Care Lane, Architectural Review of a wall sign and monument sign within the Office-Medical Business District.

Applicant: Chldtime Learning Center

Agent: Jennifer Cameron, District Manager

Ms. Cameron stated they have recently acquired this property from North Country Academy and are seeking approval for signage. They are proposing the addition of a sign above the entry area that will display our name and also to replace the monument sign. This will be the same size as what exists currently and will be replaced with a faux brick to match what is on the building. A floodlight is proposed to light up the monument sign at night. Two gooseneck lighting fixtures will be hung over the proposed building sign.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the signage seems appropriate as well as the proposed lighting. However, the styrofoam brick for the monument sign is not an appropriate base. The applicant will need to research an additional choice for the base. The material proposed is not appropriate and substandard.

The Commission was in agreement that a more appropriate solid material should be used.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Child Time Signage, 7 Care Lane that we approve with the following condition – base material of the monument sign to be a true brick face material, details to be submitted and approved administratively. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

9. **20190763 SMALL CELL ANTENNA NODE 4**, 516 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review of AT&T Omni antenna to be mounted atop of an existing wooden pole with ancillary equipment within the Rural Residential District.
10. **20190764 SMALL CELL ANTENNA NODE 6**, 15 Henning Road, Architectural Review of AT&T Omni antenna to be mounted atop of an existing wooden pole with ancillary equipment within the Rural Residential District.
11. **20190759 SMALL CELL ANTENNA NODE 7**, 295 Excelsior Avenue, Architectural Review of AT&T Omni antenna to be mounted atop of an existing wooden pole with ancillary equipment within the Transect-4 & 5 District.
12. **20190760 SMALL CELL ANTENNA NODE 8**, Route 9P, Architectural Review of AT&T Omni antenna to be mounted atop of an existing wooden pole with ancillary equipment within the Rural Residential District.
13. **20190758 SMALL CELL ANTENNA NODE 10**, 133 Union Avenue, Architectural Review of AT&T Omni antenna to be mounted atop of an existing wooden pole with ancillary equipment within the Urban Residential-4 District.
14. **20190761 SMALL CELL ANTENNA NODE 11**, 37 Marion Avenue, Architectural Review of AT&T Omni antenna to be mounted atop of an existing wooden pole with ancillary equipment within the Tourist Related Business District.
15. **20190762 SMALL CELL ANTENNA NODE 14**, Union Avenue, Architectural Review of AT&T Omni antenna to be mounted atop of an existing wooden pole with ancillary equipment within the public right of way.

Applicant: AT&T

Agent: Brenda Blask-Lewis, Centerline Communication

Ms. Blask-Lewis stated the applicant is proposing to install cell antenna on utility poles in the City's right of way. The poles are generally owned by National Grid. These are 2 foot antennas attached to the top of the pole and along the pole will be an equipment cabinet and ancillary cables which will be painted to match each of the poles. These antennas are being proposed to fill the need to increase coverage for areas where there is a need for a large amount of data.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Small Cell Antenna Nodes 4, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11 and 14 that the application be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Commission Caravan, Tuesday, September 10, 2019 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, September 18, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:12 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 9-18-19