



DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 2, 2019

7:00 P.M.

RECREATION CENTER

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Chris Bennett; Leslie DiCarlo; Leslie Mechem; Rob DuBoff; Ellen Sheehan

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:01 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the September 18, 2019 DRC meeting with minor corrections. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. **20190918 IN THE ZONE PRO SHOP SIGNAGE**, 32 Ballston Avenue, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.
2. **20190949 PLAZA 15 STORAGE SIGNAGE**, 30 Gick Road, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.
3. **20190949 BARTON RESIDENCE EXTERIOR MODIFICATION**, 649 Route 29, Architectural Review of a rear bedroom addition to an existing structure within the Rural Residential District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on items #1-#3. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on these applications. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the In the Zone Pro Shop Signage, 32 Ballston Avenue, Plaza 15 Storage Signage, 30 Gick Road, and Barton Residence Exterior Modification, 649 Route 29, that these applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

1. **20190885 DELANEY DRUM PORCH**, 31 York Avenue, Historic Review of an existing porch renovation within the the Urban Residential-3 District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the applicant appeared before the Commission at a previous meeting. Additional information and clarification of the project was provided.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the Delaney Drum Porch, 31 York Avenue that the application be approved as submitted. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

RECUSAL: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, recused from the following application.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman assumed the duties of the Chair.

2. **20190879 MASONIC LODGE RESIDENCE RENOVATION**, 687 North Broadway, Historic Review of the conversion of this existing structure to a single-family residence within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Agent: Michael Tuck, Balzer & Tuck Architecture

Mr. Tuck stated at the last appearance before the Commission there were several concerns raised. The Commission felt the fence should be moved back to line up with the front façade. No PVC is permitted for the trim components. The entry walk was discussed and the Commission suggested Bluestone in a larger pattern or another option which would be more in feeling with the formal nature of the home. Information on the driveway material and entry walkway was also requested. Discussion was held concerning the balustrades. A visual presentation of the site was provided. The entryway is being proposed in concrete enhanced with brick pavers along the sides. On the east elevation a wood balustrade system is proposed. A half height light for the entry door. On the west portion of the home they are proposing a three quarter height light for that door keeping in better proportion with the windows. Examples of the door and balustrade system were provided to the Commission.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated it appears the applicant has addressed all the issues the Commission had.

Rob DuBoff questioned the windows.

Mr. Tuck stated the windows along the basement level will be aluminum clad. The first and second floor windows will be all wood.

Rob DuBoff stated he still has concern regarding the open deck area on the second floor.

Leslie DiCarlo questioned the necessity for a door.

Mr. Tuck stated it is the applicant request that the door remain.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Masonic Lodge Residence Renovation, 687 Broadway that the application be approved with the revisions as submitted. Approval of the south addition removal. Approval of the west first story addition with return for review of final design of infill at this location when more information is provided. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, opposed; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 5-1

NOTE: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman resumed her position on the Commission.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman resumed her position on the Commission.

3. **20190929 NATIONAL MUSEUM OF RACING EXTERIOR**, 191 Union Avenue, Architectural Review of replacement entrance storefront and new chiller enclosure within the Institutional Horse Track-Related District.

Agent: Matt Hurff, Frost Hurff Architecture'

Mr. Hurff stated on the Ludlow Street elevation of this property there are currently two chillers which were placed there in the 1980's. They have reached the end of their life. These chillers were placed in a peculiar setup. What they are proposing is to place the new chillers next to the mechanical room and place a brick wall surrounding them. A visual presentation of the side was provided. The applicants are also proposing changing out the storefront window system and replacing them in kind with a wider non aluminum system.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a fairly straightforward application. The Chair requested cut sheets for the file from the applicant's agent.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Ellen Sheehan made a motion in the matter of the National Museum of Racing Exterior, 191 Union Avenue that the application be approved as submitted with the following condition – cut sheets to be submitted for the file. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

The following two applications were tabled due to lack of representation.

4. **20190913 FRANCO PORCH**, 171 Church Street, Architectural Review of porch repair and material modifications within the Urban Residential-3 District.
5. **20190912 CITIZENS BANK EXTERIOR**, 1 Ballston Avenue, Architectural Review of exterior façade modifications within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Commission Caravan, Tuesday, October 8, 2019 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, October 16, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 7:30 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 10-16-19