PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Cynthia Corbett; Leslie Mechern; Chris Bennett; Leslie DiCarlo; Rob DuBoff

STAFF: Susan Barden, Principal Planner, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:03 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechern made a motion to approve the March 20, 2019 meeting as submitted. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman questioned if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, abstained; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechern, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0-1

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be “approvable” without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the “consent agenda” and dealt with individually.

1. 20190304 MAX LEVEL FITNESS SIGNAGE, 166 High Rock Avenue. Architectural Review of a change in wall signage within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

2. 20190312 15 BALLSTON AVENUE SIGNAGE, 15 Ballston Avenue, Architectural Review of a new wall sign and change in freestanding signage within the Transect 5 Neighborhood Center District.

3. 20190306 73 BEEKMAN STUDIO SIGNAGE, 73 Beekman Street, Architectural Review of a wall sign within the Neighborhood Complementary Use -1 District.

4. 20190311 PITNEY MEADOWS BATHROOMS, 223 West Avenue, Architectural Review of a new restroom structure within the Rural Residential and Pitney Meadows Planned Unit Development Districts.

5. 20190310 PITNEY MEADOWS GREENHOUSE, 223 West Avenue, Architectural Review of a 22’ x30’ greenhouse within the Rural Residential and Pitney Meadows Planned Unit Development Districts.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #5. None heard.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Max Level Fitness Signage, 165 High Rock Avenue; 15 Ballston Avenue Signage, 15 Ballston Avenue; 73 Beekman Studio Signage, 73 Beekman Street; Pitney Meadows Bathrooms, 223 West Avenue; Pitney Meadows Greenhouse, 223 West Avenue, that these applications be approved as submitted. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

**C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION**

1. **20192065 FALVEY MIXED USE BUILDING,** 65 Beekman Street, Architectural Review of a new 2-story mixed-use building within the Neighborhood Complementary Use-1 District.

Applicant: Matthew Falvey

Agent: Sue Davis, SD Atelier Architecture

Ms. Davis provided history of the project which was previously approved but never acted upon. Mr. Falvey is the new owner. The site is currently a vacant lot which we are proposing to build a new 2 story building filling in this missing tooth of the street. We have made some slight modifications from the previous submission including some architectural details from the neighborhood. Information was provided concerning the proposed materials including Anderson E series windows aluminum clad, dark color frame are proposed as well as Hardie Board siding to comply with fire regulations. Color samples were provided for the Commission’s review. The applicant is proposing an owner occupied second floor residence with a commercial space on the first floor front with a small residential unit in the rear. Ms. Davis provided views and information concerning all elevations.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman requested the applicant review the adjustments which have been made since the original approval.

Ms. Davis stated the only change which has been made is that the roof prior was approximately 8 inches taller and we have reduced that. We have made more interior changes rather than exterior changes. I will outline the changes for the Commission. We previously proposed some stone which has been changed to Hardie Board siding. We have changed doors to windows on the rear elevation. Also the roof was designed as a green roof but the cost was prohibitive.

Mr. Falvey stated on the rear of the building where the 3 bay windows currently exists there was a sliding door. That is the apartment and for safety reasons it was changed to the windows. I like the look of the Hardie Board siding especially with the trim work added to the building. The roof lines were lowered and although it is not a green roof access to the roof will still be accessible.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated lowering the roof line, replacing the slider with a three bay window and removing the stone and replacing it with Hardie Board are appropriate changes and headed in the right direction.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission.

It was the consensus of the Commission that the application was appropriate and fits in with the character of the neighborhood.
Leslie DiCarlo spoke regarding the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundations Letter and their concerns regarding the fenestrations. Ms. DiCarlo stated she feels the changes the applicant made were good ones.

Ms. Davis stated she has spoken with Samantha Bossart, Executive Director, Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. She stated she loves the project but does have some concerns regarding the windows. I believe her concern was regarding the height of the windows and perhaps if we remove the transoms and the trim. I was unable to speak to her regarding this letter since she has gone out of town.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman summarized the letter which the Commission received on April 16, 2019 from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. The Foundation appreciates that the roof height has been reduced since the previously received approval. However, the Foundation has concerns that the second floor window fenestration is not in keeping with the historic context of the neighborhood.

Ms. Davis stated the upper floor of the building has ten foot ceilings internally and we would like to keep tall vertical windows. The option I briefly sketched today but was unable to review with the Foundation was to eliminate the trim band and do taller double hung windows.

Chris Bennett stated the building is lovely, the design is unique. He sees no reason in changing it. You taken creative liberty and not everything needs to fit in a box. It is unique and a beautiful building.

Leslie DiCarlo agrees with Chris Bennett.

Cynthia Corbett stated it clearly differentiates it from a historical building.

Leslie Mechem and Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman agreed.

Rob DuBoff stated he agrees but does have an issue with the balcony doors on the second floor being a solid panel of glass versus a divided glass. It looks very store-front-ish. If the opportunity presents itself perhaps a divided glass door would be more appropriate.

Ms. Davis stated she will return with some options for the Commission.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated all the changes presented this evening including the discussions the Commission seems comfortable with the project.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the materials.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the applicant will return before the Commission following approval of the Special Use Permit.

2. **20190173 GRANT RESIDENCE ADDITION**, 149 Spring Street, Historic Review of a new 2nd story addition to an existing structure within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Jamie and Owen Grant

Agent: Mike Tuck, Baizer and Tuck Architecture

Mr. Tuck stated the applicant appeared before the Commission on March 6, 2019 with Brett Baizer, the designer. Mr. Tuck reviewed the changes which were made since the applicant’s last appearance. Some comments and concerns the Commission raised were concerns regarding doors and exterior lighting on the second floor as well as an interior post on the proposed corner of the porch. There was some question about the prominence of the second entry and the height of the proposed roof addition between the historic and the later addition portion. We worked through some design changes which
were submitted. Mr. Tuck reviewed the site and the project for the Commission. All elevations were reviewed as well as the proposed mudroom and the second floor workspace and balcony. A minor configuration in this area allowed for some roof changes. We maintained ceiling heights with the addition to the rear. Currently we have pulled the roof down and aligned the eaves with the historic portion of the building. We have omitted the second floor balcony which reduced the issue of the secondary door confusion with the primary door. The language of the back porch is in keeping with the front porch. On the second floor by removing the door and the balcony we were able to replicate the historic portions of the windows that are in the main portion and we added a window in the mudroom area to break up the mass. The porch roof is low slope roof and will match what is going on with the front porch. Mr. Tuck provided a visual of what was proposed earlier contrasting it with the new.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated that this proposal is far improved from the original presentation. It presents far better and The Commission is happy the applicant and applicant’s agent have addressed the issues of the Commission. We do have correspondence from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation dated April 15, 2019 stating the Foundation still has significant concerns that the historic rear extension that dates back prior to the 1880s is being completely obscured and the historic evolution of the building is being lost.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any comments or questions from the Commission concerning the application or the Preservation Foundations comments.

Cynthia Corbett stated this is a big improvement. She is not bothered by the rear extension and is happy with the changes. It fits with our guidelines.

Leslie Mechem stated she agrees with Cindy. She feels the pilasters on the porch help to anchor it. The fenestration on the second floor really anchors it to the historic home.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she is in agreement with the Commission members comments. She is happy with the changes. It is a very much improved design. It improves the addition that was previous to this application. It allows for the original building to have its own unique character. I realize it is still a big addition but it is appropriate in how it was treated and the character of it.

Leslie DiCarlo stated in reviewing the Preservation Foundations comments and she does not feel that any of their issues or problems with this project can be solved. The issues are already in place with the last addition. This rendition is an improvement over the previous presentation.

Rob DuBoff stated it is difficult to imagine what the impact will be until after the project is built. The Foundations comments concerning the addition being trivialized is a fair point but it has already been trivialized with the previous addition. My only suggestion would be for the applicant to consider ganging those windows together with a mullion between to bring them closer together. This is a better effort to bring things together.

Chris Bennett stated the changes are great. He has no issue with the project. This home was changed many years ago. The previous applicant had changed this home. The new design changes improve the property and the design changes are are spot on.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she agrees with Rob concerning the windows being moved closer together.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Karen Cavotta made a motion in the matter of the application of the Grant Residence Addition, 149 Spring Street, to approve with the following condition – A suggestion to bring the two windows at the front façade addition together with a large mullion or trim between to create one large window. Seconded by Leslie Mechem.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.
VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

3. **20190227 WEST HILL PLAZA EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 93-109 West Avenue, requested modification to an Architectural Review approval within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Applicant: John Casey

Agent: Keith Cramer, Architect

Mr. Cramer stated they appeared before the Commission several times in the past. They have made modifications and revisions to their approved project back in 2014. The treatment of the towers is an issue which has been a source of controversy between the owner and the Commission. We are basically reverting to the original tower plan. The applicant provided a visual of what was originally approved. We wanted stucco originally with a W in the stucco design. All the flat panels on the tower will go back to stucco board. A visual of what is the applicants are proposing was provided to the Commission. The top panel on the tower will be a cement based stucco. Accent stripes are proposed. Below that are glass windows and below the windows will be stucco to match that above. The block towers will be stained brown which is the accent color. An awning was added. Visual was provided to the Commission. Stone veneer is proposed not brick.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this was what the Commission was wrestling with. This is a huge improvement over what currently exists. We are pleased with the changes in the tower and the stone work as well as the glass addition. This is a nice improvement over what is currently there and it is updated and modernized.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the application of the West Hill Plaza Exterior Modifications, 93-109 West Avenue, be approved as submitted. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 7-0

4. **20190318 KISBER WALK & DRIVEWAY**, 649 North Broadway, Historic Review of a new walk and driveway materials within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicant: Michael Kisber

Agent: Parker Crossley, Grassshopper Gardens

Mr. Crossley stated he is here to present a change in the walkway materials from brick to a natural bluestone thermal finished and very period to the time the home was built. Mr. Crossley apologized to the Board; he was not familiar with the format and procedure to change the walkway. Photographs were provided to the Commission concerning the project. Mr. Crossley spoke regarding the owners desire to enhance the property. The bluestone compliments history and the use of natural materials and stone. Trying to bring back the beauty of bluestone from New York State. We are here this evening to determine the next step in this process.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman thanked the applicant for the presentation. In an effort to manage expectations we understand that the bulk of the work has been done already. We are required to review this application as if it were presented initially. I will begin by reading some comments from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. The Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation has reviewed the application to seek approval for the removal of the historic brick herringbone walkway that leads to the front door and replacement with a wider walkway of blue stone bordered with Belgium granite cobble block that has already taken place. The Italianate residence, built in 1856, is a contributing building of the North Broadway Historic District listed on the National Register of Historic Places. This residence is considered one of the earliest houses on North Broadway. The brick walkway is one of the many components that contribute to the fabric of this significant historic buildings as well as the historic district, where very few herringbone brick walkways remain.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated she would like reiterate some of the Commission’s historic guidelines for Site Details and Streetscapes. Brick, granite, slate or concrete curbs and gutters, and original or historic sidewalks should be preserved. If repair is required; materials should match the existing in size, color, texture and tooling. Our standards are repair versus replace. This walkway is a character defining feature of this home. This particular home on North Broadway, the brick walkway is part of that building. The history is reflected in that material. That brick walkway has been repaired along the way, but certainly not replaced in its entirety. This should have never taken place. Again we have to review this as if you are appearing for this to be initially installed. I feel very strongly that the brick walkway should remain in place.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this will be broken up into two discussions. The first will be a discussion concerning the brick walkway and a separate conversation concerning the apron of the driveway.

Chris Bennett stated he agrees with the Chair. The brick walkway on this property is significant. It is a prominent feature of that property.

Rob DuBoff questioned where is the original brick which was removed.

Mr. Crossley stated we can salvage it. It is stored at the shop. I do not have 100% of it but we can match it.

Rob DuBoff stated he agrees with the Chair and Chris Bennett.

Leslie DiCarlo stated he agrees with the Commission.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman agrees with the Commission. It should be repaired.

Leslie Mechem stated she agrees with the Commission members. Also the brick walkway matches with the brick home.

Cynthia Corbett stated she agrees with the Commission. The walkway does need to be repaired and re-laid.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated there is a consensus among the Commission that the historic guidelines be respected. Especially this project based on this historic home.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated we will now discuss the Belgian block apron as a second part of the application. The Belgian Block apron is not inappropriate for this area. It is an improvement from the asphalt apron it replaced.

Mr. Crossley stated he does not have a photograph of this project. He did however, obtain a permit for this project from the City of Saratoga Springs. There were some limitations and they stipulated they would not be responsible for plow damage.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience who wishes to comment.

Mr. Gold stated he is representing the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. He applauds the Commission for unanimously rejecting the sidewalk that has been constructed for this property. The Commission has done the right thing. I echo that the brick sidewalk should be replaced in the proper width.
Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the use of sidewalks materials.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the application of the Kisber Walk and Driveway, 649 North Broadway, that the application be denied as presented and the Design Review Commission further requires that the applicant restore the previously removed historic herringbone brick sidewalk. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 7-0**

5. **FLAT ROCK CENTRE PARKING STRUCTURE**, Maple, Lake and High Rock Avenues, discussion on presentation of proposed parking structure within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

Susan Barden, Principal Planner stated the Joint Board Meeting was held on March 21, 2019. A presentation was provided by the design team noting the project has a Phase I and Phase II. There was hope to have some feedback provided by both Boards to provide to the design team. There was no real opportunity to discuss the presentation and the aspects of the particular project. This is a follow-up meeting to speak about comments and concerns of the DRC and provide that feedback.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated following this discussion we will draft some recommendations and review at our May 1, 2019 meeting.

Susan Barden, Senior Planner provided a draft of the Planning Board’s recommendations for the DRC’s information and review. These are both broad and specific.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Commission is in receipt of the letter from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. It was read into the record. The Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation has reviewed the proposed Saratoga Springs City Center Flat Rock Center Parking Structure which is immediately adjacent to the Broadway Historic District listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The Saratoga Springs City Center is a tremendous economic generator and an important gathering space for our City. The Foundation recognizes the need to accommodate parking to maintain the vitality of the downtown as well as the need for city center to meet its current and future operational parking requirements. When the Saratoga Springs City Center initially proposed the parking structure at the site the foundation had significant concerns regarding the three levels of parking approximately 100 feet in length which was located above Maple Avenue. The letter then describes the feeling of importance of Maple Avenue and the transition. We move onto the Foundation is very pleased that the three levels of parking over Maple Avenue have been removed from the proposal and replaced with a transparent pedestrian walkway. An element the foundation advocated for in 2014 and has a historic precedence within the City which was the Congress Hotel pedestrian walkway over Spring Street. The Foundation is also pleased with the overall height, scale and mass and pleased that the overall height and mass was reduced and the setbacks increased on High Rock Avenue and York Avenue. They look forward to reviewing additional details regarding design and materials as the project develops.

Rob DuBoff stated the Mass and Scale is improved from what was originally proposed. It is an opportunity at street level to introduce mixed use space with retail and it seems like this is yet just another parking garage in an important part of the City. The design could really be improved so that it presents and read more of a building with parking inside.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she agrees. It is a great opportunity to introduce activity at the street level. This project is better. The narrow pedestrian walkway is nice. The idea of the park is nice. I think that the guidelines, even though the City is not bound by those guidelines, that there should be some mixed use at the street level or at least the potential for it at the street level.
Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the zoning district the project is located in.

Cynthia Corbett stated this project is adjacent to the Historic District.

Ryan McMahon, Executive Director of the City Center stated this is in the Architectural District.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated she is happy with the reduction in height and mass and scale. I still have concerns about the High Rock elevation as well as the Maple Avenue elevations. She appreciates that the Green Belt Trail is being accessed down the street with some renderings of the landscaping of the area. This should not be considered in what we look at since when the leaves are gone the building will remain. At the meeting we discussed what does it feel like at the pedestrian level of openings and elevations. These are very long elevations. There is no pedestrian interaction with shops or restaurants or something which engages pedestrians. I don't want to feel like I am walking by a parking garage similar to other areas in the City. This building has much more potential than the previous building. I am concerned regarding the level of detail in the building and hope there will be some level of consideration for the pedestrian level.

Chris Bennett stated this is an opportunity to do something unique and lead by example for this project. There is no way to put our head around what this building will look like.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the applicant is looking for general comments and suggestions at this point. Karen made a Good point about the application in this case because the mass and scale has been reduced greatly, we do have to make sure that we are communicating with the applicant materials that will look and materials that will not work.

Chris Bennett questioned what is being proposed in Phase II.

Cynthia Corbett stated they are proposing liner buildings on Maple Avenue.

Mr. McMahon, Executive Director of the City Center stated Mayor Kelly just reconvened the Flat Rock Committee. Phase II will include liner buildings, park space, and incubator space. This will not be for residential use. Also, we are possibly looking at the south end of the lot for park space.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she has concerns regarding Phase II. Phase I is just the parking garage.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning the phasing of the project and will its time frame for completion.

Chris Bennett stated we need to look at the parking structure on its own merits. It needs to stand on its own.

Leslie Mechem stated she agrees with Karen's statements. I have mixed feelings about the parking garage. We currently have a parking lot which is not attractive. In some ways this building would be an improvement over that. The mass and scale is ok but I too worry about another walkway. People will just walk past it. This is an opportunity to have some mixed use so people will walk, linger and stay.

Mr. McMahon stated the City Center is working with the Farmer's Market. 70% of the entire structure is flat and can be converted to other uses in the future. We will work with them to have some temporary enclosures.

Cynthia Corbett stated she feels the High Rock elevations seems unbalanced and disjointed.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the glass pedestrian walkway is very interesting and neat feature.

The Commission voiced concerns regarding lighting, which is critical. Consideration of solar panel installation in Phase II was discussed.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the Commission has discussed and provided some feedback. Susan Barden, Principal Planner, City of Saratoga Springs stated she will summarize these issues and provide the Commission with
a listing of comments and suggestions for the City Council. Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated these are the concerns that the Commission has brought forth this evening - more of a contributing structure – less of a standalone parking garage. Perhaps retail on the first floor. Overall mass and scale is improved from the past. Relate the parking structure to the City Center.

Mr. Gold speaking on behalf of the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation, reminded the Commission of the upcoming Presidential Award nominations and the expiration date for submissions being the 24th of April.

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:
Design Review Commission Caravan, Tuesday, April 23, 2019 at 5:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, May 1, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:
There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:05 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 5-15-19