PRESENT:  Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Cynthia Corbett; Chris Bennett; Leslie DiCarlo; Rob DuBoff

ABSENT:  Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Leslie Mechem;

STAFF:  Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER:  Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Approval of meeting minutes was deferred to the May 15, 2019 Design Review Commission Meeting.

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. 20190265 FALVEY MIXED USE BUILDING, 65 Beekman Street, Architectural Review of a new two story, Mixed use building within the Neighborhood Complementary Use-1 District.

2. 20190357 SPA CASCADA AWNING, 487 Broadway, Historic Review of a replacement awning on existing framework within the Transect 6 Urban Core District.

3. 20190375 SISKA'S BARBERSHOP SIGNAGE, 148 South Broadway, Architectural Review of a new wall sign within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

4. 20190374 ST. PAUL'S LUTHERAN CHURCH NEW DOOR, 149 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review of modifications within the Urban Residential-3 District.

5. 20180262 RUSSEL EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 499 Union Avenue, Architectural Review of modifications to an earlier approval (window placement) within the Suburban Residential-1 District.

6. 20190154 BANK OF AMERICA ROOFTOP STAIR, 27 Division Street, Architectural Review of a rooftop ladder and landing with the Transect 6 Urban Core District.

7. 2017.087 24 CAROLINE APARTMENTS EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 24 Caroline Street, Architectural Review of an egress balcony and ladder within the Transect 6 Urban Core District.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Items #1 through #7.
Rob DuBoff stated he had some questions or concerns regarding agenda item #1. This was pulled from the consent agenda and placed on the regular agenda.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Spa Cascada Awning, 487 Broadway, Siska’s Barbershop Signage, 148 South Broadway, St. Paul’s Lutheran Church New Door, 149 Lake Avenue, Russell Exterior Modifications, 499 Union Avenue, Bank of America Rooftop Stair, 27 Division Street, Caroline Apartments Exterior Modifications, 24 Caroline Street, that these applications be approved as submitted. Leslie DiCarlo seconded the motion.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 5-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

**ITEM MOVED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA**

1. **20190265 FALVEY MIXED USE BUILDING,** 65 Beekman Street, Architectural Review of a new two story, Mixed use building within the Neighborhood Complementary Use-1 District.

Applicant: Matthew Falvey

Rob DuBoff stated there were several items which were discussed at the last meeting for inclusion in the approval. Has this information been provided.

Mr. Falvey stated at the last appearance before the Commission discussion ensued regarding diverting the snow from the front sidewalk with the use of roof diverters, as well as the use of Borel for trim work and Hardie Board Siding. All these changes have been made and are incorporated into the project.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Falvey Mixed Use Building, 65 Beekman Street, that the application be approved as submitted this evening with the following conditions - use of roof diverters on the front of the building, Borel trim and Hardie Board Siding to be use for the project. Cynthia Corbett seconded the motion.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 5-0
2. 20190359 STRAUSS WALKWAY AND STAIRS, 26 Fifth Avenue, Historic Review of exterior modifications (walkway and front stair materials) within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicant: Amy and Daniel Strauss

Agent: Kevin Bretinski, Contractor

Mr. Bretinski stated the applicants are proposing to remove the existing concrete walkway and replace with thermal flush blue stone. They are also proposing to replace the wood porch stairs with bluestone treads and granite risers.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated the Preservation Foundation has submitted correspondence concerning this application regarding the replacement of the existing concrete walkway with thermal flush bluestone and replace the wood porch stairs with bluestone threads and granite risers. Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman read the following into the record.

The Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation stated that the circa 1900 Free Classic Queen Anne style house is a contributing building to the East Side Historic District listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The Historic Review Standards are to: preserve rather than remove; repair rather than replace; promote historical accuracy; and recognize the significance of historic time periods. The Foundation does not object to the use of bluestone treads and granite risers. However, the two steps that extend beyond the granite sidewalls should remain the same width as the other stairs as to not obscure the front of the granite sidewalks. Per the Historic District Design Guidelines for Site Details and Streetscapes – Street, curbs and sidewalks – brick, granite, slate or concrete curbs and gutters, original or historic sidewalks should be preserved. If repair is required, materials should match the existing in size, color, texture and tooling. Also, maintain the existing width of neighboring sidewalks. The house was built at the turn of the century. Most likely the existing concrete walkway with curbing is historic. The walkway should be repaired in kind. The use of thermal finish full range bluestone is not historically appropriate.

Discussion ensued among the Commission members.

Chris Bennett agrees with the Preservation Foundation and the guidelines should be followed. The bluestone staircase would be appropriate but the sidewalks should be repaired and replaced in kind.

Rob DuBoff spoke regarding the curbing and the fact that it does match others on the street. It is a unique district with the walkways to the street. He also spoke regarding the historic guidelines. The walkway and gate with the arch details is an important feature of the site and should be maintained.

Cynthia Corbett stated she is bothered by the change in the steps to the sidewalk as well. She would like to see it maintained.

Mr. Bretinski spoke regarding the concrete steps and use of the blue stone and granite.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there were any further comments from the Commission. None heard.

Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development stated the DRC has a short board this evening. Perhaps the applicant would choose to defer the application until the next meeting scheduled for May 15, 2019 giving them some time to review and/or make changes to their application noting the temperature of the Commission.

Discussion ensued among the Commission members and the consensus would be to deny the application this evening.

It was the determination of the applicant to table the application for two weeks.

3. 20190343 WALBRIDGE BUILDING EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 107 Lake Avenue, Historic Review of front porch renovation, change in materials) within the Urban Residential-3 District.
Applicant: Bill Walbridge

Agent: Ted Martin, Contractor

Mr. Walbridge provided a visual of the site. He is proposing a renovation of the porch. The west left stairs are to be removed. Replacement of brick pier, flooring skirt board, rails, and balusters is proposed. The flooring is deteriorated. Flooring materials proposed to be Azak Tung and groove. We will keep the lattice work. Balusters and railings are to be replaced as well due to deterioration.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated the Commission has received correspondence from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. The correspondence was read into the record. The Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation has reviewed the application to remove the left stairs and replace a brick pier, flooring, skirt board, rails and balusters. The 1870s Italianate style residence is a contributing building to the East Side Historic District listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The full width front porch with chamfered square posts and turned wood balustrade is a significant Historic feature of the house. The Historic Review Standards of the Historic Review Ordinance are to – preserve rather than remove, repair rather than replace, promote historical accuracy, and recognize the significance of historic time periods. Per the porches and decks historic guidelines for porches – every effort should be made to preserve an original or historic Porch including the original size, design and materials. Demolition of an existing porch is to be avoided. A porch and its elements, replaced due to severe deterioration, should match the original in size, shape, rhythm, dimensions, material and quality. Duplication is preferred. Keep original elements to use as a pattern. If duplication is not possible, try to locate features at an architectural salvage location. The use of natural materials is preferred. The use of pressure treated wood is appropriate for concealed substructure. Exposed or pressure treated wood is discouraged. Latticework and skirting boards, when used should be placed in a frame. The use of natural materials is preferred. The west stairs were added after 1948 most likely when a second entrance was added. Since they were not original the Foundation does not object to removal of the west stairs nor does it object to the single brick pier being replaced as long as the new pier matches the original in material, size, shape and color as the existing pier. The Foundation strongly objects to the use of synthetic materials to replace the skirt board, decking rails and balusters. These elements should be either repaired or replaced in-kind.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated removal of the stairs and infill of the stairs is not an issue.

Cynthia Corbett questioned the balusters and their condition. They should be repaired or replaced in-kind.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated the bigger issue comes from the materials proposed.

Cynthia Corbett stated the floor should be replaced with natural materials perhaps a mahogany.

Ted Martin, Contractor stated the posts were removed when the stairs were added. The railing and balusters were changed as well. Concerning the railings and balusters some of them are rotted.

Discussion ensued among the Commission concerning historic guidelines.

Chris Bennett spoke regarding owning a historic property and being a steward of this property.

Mr. Walbridge requested the Commission to allow him and his contractor to discuss some of the issues concerning this application. This application will resume at the end of the meeting.

4. **20190356 PERRY RESIDENCE EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 201 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review of exterior modifications (rear sliding door, new roof over west elevation doorway) within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Lysle and Raymond Perry

The applicants stated they are proposing the removal of a window and replacing it with a 5 foot wide sliding door and steps.
They are currently 3 steps to the yard. This renovation cannot be seen from the front of the home. Also, on the driveway side of the home there is an existing side entry. They are proposing a small roof over the entrance way with railings. This will be constructed of wood to match the front porch. They are proposing the use of Anderson vinyl window with wood interior. Cut sheets were provided.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Cynthia Corbett made a motion in the matter of the Perry Residence Exterior Modifications, 201 Lake Avenue that the application be approved as submitted. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

Karen Cavotta asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 5-0**

2. **20190343 WALBRIDGE BUILDING EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 107 Lake Avenue, Historic Review of front porch renovation, change in materials) within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Mr. Walbridge stated he agreed with the Commission and is willing to remove and replace in kind. Balusters, railing and flooring, all historic materials will be repaired or replaced in kind.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Walbridge Building Exterior Modifications, 107 Lake Avenue that the application be approved with the following conditions – Repair of historic materials. Where materials are too deteriorated, replace in-kind with natural materials. Columns and brick piers are to remain as-is. Seconded by Chris Bennett

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Cynthia Corbett, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 5-0**

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**

Design Review Commission Caravan, Tuesday, May 7, 2019 at 5:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, May 15, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**

There being no further business to discuss Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:15 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 5-15-19