DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MINUTES (FINAL)
WEDNESDAY, JUNE 19, 2019
7:00 P.M.
RECREATION CENTER

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Chris Bennett; Leslie DiCarlo; Rob DuBoff; Steven Rowland, Alternate

ABSENT: Leslie Mechem

STAFF: Susan Barden, Principal Planner, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Approval of meeting minutes was deferred to the July 3, 2019 meeting.

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. 20190563 STAR RADIO SIGNAGE, 34 Congress Street – Suite 103, Architectural Review of a wall sign within the Transect-4 Urban Neighborhood District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Item #1. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Star Radio Signage, 34 Congress Street – Suite 103, that the application be approved as submitted. Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0
C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

1. **20190501 SPRING STREET WINDOW**, 5 Spring Street, Historic Review of the restoration of an exterior window within the Transect-6 Urban Core District.

No representation for this project.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated per our request additional information and documentation was provided by the applicant, including dimensions as well as cut sheets. The third floor windows will be replaced, per our suggestion. The new window will be replaced in kind with an aluminum clad casement window fabricated to match the existing windows on the 3rd floor. The Chair stated she feels comfortable moving this application forward at this time.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any additional questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Spring Street Window Restoration, 5 Spring Street, that the application be approved as submitted this evening. Chris Bennett seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

2. **20190497 SOUTH BROADWAY HOTEL**, 176 South Broadway, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency (Architectural Review) of demolition of existing building and construction of new hotel within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Core District.

Applicant: Larkin Development

Agent: Brett Balzer, Dennis McGowan, Balzer-Tuck Architecture; Paul Lambert, Bonacio Construction

Mr. Balzer stated the project consists of the demolition of the existing Turf and Spa Hotel at 176 South Broadway. This will be replaced with a four story 120 room hotel with a below grade parking garage. The developer is out of Burlington, Vermont and this is their first project in Saratoga Springs. We will provide a short presentation.

Mr. McGowan provided the Commission with a visual presentation of the project. The project will provide a drive lane through the site out to Lincoln Avenue. We are proposing below grade parking entered through the rear of the site. A visual of the surrounding properties were provided as well as floor plans and a review of all elevations. The project will engage the street and pedestrians as much as possible with the design.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is an impressive project. This is quite a modern building and it is interesting to see in this location. Any questions or comments for the applicants from the Commission. We are only making a determination for SEQRA Lead Agent this evening.

Rob DuBoff questioned if the applicant had thought about materials.

Mr. McGowan stated they are trying to integrate some of the materials and details in the area as well as some modern materials and glazing. We are trying to balance the traditional with more modern materials.

Rob DuBoff also voiced concerns regarding the stair tower.
Mr. Balzer stated they are working on trying to integrate this as they further develop the design.

Chris Bennett questioned heating and cooling systems for the hotel.

Mr. McGowan stated they are proposing electric vertical heating and cooling for each individual unit. We will attempt to camouflage them as much as possible.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she likes the project and the use of the brick. Great project.

Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated this is an interesting building and would like to see how it develops further. She is hoping there are opportunities to incorporate more green landscape aspects to it.

Steven Rowland, Alternate, spoke regarding strengthening the main entryway. He likes the interaction with the street and looks forward to seeing it move forward.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the applicant has received some great feedback this evening.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the South Broadway Hotel, 176 South Broadway that the Design Review Commission defer Lead Agency Status to the Planning Board should they choose to seek it. Steven Rowland, Alternate, seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

3. 20190524 THE GROVE/NEUMANN BUILDING ADDITION/EXPANSION, 233 Lake Avenue, Architectural Review of the expansion of an existing structure with the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicant: Newman LLC

Agent: Kristin Nickerson, Mike Tuck, Balzer Tuck Architecture; Jim Chandler, Bonacio Construction

Ms. Nickerson stated the applicant is before the Commission this evening for additions and expansions to the Grove/Neumann Building. The building was changed into apartments in 2015. They were two additions added to the building. The project began as a 55+ apartment complex. When the age restriction was removed the building became fully occupied. Currently, the applicant is looking to add additional apartments to make use of undeveloped space in the building. A visual presentation was provided to the Commission noting the areas to be in-filled with the additions as well as a review of all elevations. Many of the rear additions will not be visible from the street. Ms. Nickerson reviewed the proposed materials fiber cement paneling to match the color of the stone on the building. We are proposing to keep the height of the addition to match what currently exists as well as keeping the proportion of the windows to match what currently exists. Also, some black metal balconies will be added to match current balconies. Visual perspective views were also provided.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is very well done. Regarding infill the structure seems more balanced. The materials are appropriate. In terms of an infill project this is the best you are going to get.

Steven Rowland, Alternate, stated this seems very appropriate. The use of materials and proportions are complementary to the building and it speaks for itself and does not detract from the old.
Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman stated it's great.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated we are in receipt of a letter from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation. They are very pleased with the project and echoed many of the statement made here this evening. They have a recommendation – the color of the first story of the east extension be changed to match the existing stone color.

Leslie DiCarlo stated she agrees with everything Steve stated. The lower level reads as white as opposed to stone color.

Rob DuBoff questioned the cornice materials.

Ms. Nickerson stated all trim on the building will be a PVC product. This material is currently used on the building.

Chris Bennett questioned building on the stone balustrade. This could become a maintenance issue.

Ms. Nickerson explained how they plan construction in this area.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any further questions or comment from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions from the audience. None heard.

Rob DuBoff made a motion in the matter of the Grove/Neumann Building Addition/Expansion, 233 Lake Avenue, that the application be approved as submitted or shown on the attached plans. Steven Rowland, Alternate seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there is any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

4. 20190568 ROSECRA NS RESIDENCE EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 748 North Broadway, Historic Review of a garage deck pergola addition and exterior stairway removal within the Urban Residential -1 District.

Applicant: Peter and Lorena Rosecrans

Agent: Tom Frost, Frost Hurff Architecture

Mr. Frost stated the applicant recently added a 3 car garage. The applicants are now proposing a garage deck pergola addition. A visual of the site was provided for the Commission’s review. A review of all elevations was provided as well as the location of the proposed pergola, and proposed materials

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated approval this evening is for the pergola.

Mr. Frost stated the applicant was proposing an exterior stairway but that has been eliminated.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there were any questions or comments from the Commission. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie DiCarlo made a motion in the matter of the Rosecrans Residence Exterior Modifications, 748 North Broadway that the application be approved as submitted or shown on the attached plans. Rob DuBoff seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Vice Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.
VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, in favor; Leslie DiCarlo, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Steven Rowland, Alternate, in favor

MOTION PASSES:  6-0

ADJOURNED APPLICATIONS:

1. **20170676 (2017.118) DEVALL NEW CONSTRUCTION**, 59 Franklin Street, Advisory Opinion (Historic Review) to the Planning Board on a new single-family residence within the Urban Residential-4 District.

UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:

Design Review Commission Caravan, Tuesday, June 25, 2019 at 5:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, July 3, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 7:52 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary

APPROVED 7-17-19