DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES (FINAL)

WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 20, 2019
7:00 P.M.
RECREATION CENTER

PRESENT: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman; Chris Bennett; Leslie Mechem; Rob DuBoff; Ellen Sheehan

ABSENT: Leslie DiCarlo

STAFF: Bradley Birge, Administrator, Planning and Economic Development, City of Saratoga Springs

CALL TO ORDER: Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, called the meeting to order at 7:01 P.M.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, stated the proceedings of this meeting are being recorded for the benefit of the secretary. Because the minutes are not a verbatim record of the proceedings, the minutes are not a word-for-word transcript of the recording.

A. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

Leslie Mechem made a motion to approve the minutes of the November 6, 2019 DRC meeting with very minor corrections. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

VOTE:
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

MOTION PASSES: 6-0

B. POSSIBLE CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the intent of a consent agenda is to identify any application that appears to be "approvable" without need for further evaluation or discussion. If anyone wishes to further discuss any proposed consent agenda item, then that item would be pulled from the "consent agenda" and dealt with individually.

1. 20191121 TRIPLE CROWN WINE & LIQUOR SIGNAGE, 95D West Avenue, Architectural Review of 2 wall signs within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

2. 201910820 181 PHILA STREET EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS, 181 Phila Street, modification of Historic Review Approval to include walkway and rear door modification within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone on the Commission had any questions or comments on Consent Agenda Items #1 & #2. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on these applications. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Triple Crown Wine & Liquor Signage, 95D West Avenue and 181 Phila Street Exterior Modifications, 181 Phila Street, that these applications be approved as submitted. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Rob DuBoff, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 6-0

C. DRC APPLICATIONS UNDER CONSIDERATION

1. **20170994 2017.040 FADEN MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT,** West Avenue, consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency (Architectural Review) for a mixed-use development within the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated this is a procedural item and is for consideration of SEQRA Lead Agency for the Faden Mixed Use Development, West Avenue, in the Transect-5 Neighborhood Center District. Typically, the DRC defers Lead Agency status to the Planning Board in these matters.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any objection from the Commission regarding this deferral. None heard.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman made a motion in the matter of the Faden Mixed-Use Development, West Avenue, the Design Review Commission defers Lead Agency Status for SEQRA to the Planning Board should they choose to accept it. Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES:** 6-0

2. **20191060 PERONTO EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS,** 64 Van Dam Street, Architectural Review of change in roofing materials within the Urban Residential-3 District.

Applicant: Irene Peronto

Mrs. Peronto stated per her application she is requesting to replace the roof over the kitchen which is a single-story addition and the roof over the front porch if replacement is necessary to be replaced with copper. Mrs. Peronto stated she is in receipt of a letter from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation noting the roof over the kitchen is a metal roof. There are cedar shakes underneath the metal roof. The house is 152 years old. Ideally, she would like to replace the roof with cedar shakes, but it is difficult to find a roofer that installs cedar shake roofing. I did note a change to asphalt shingles on the roof and this conforms to my neighbor's roof, over the garage and additions, which is next to mine.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated the correspondence from the Saratoga Springs Preservation Foundation suggests that the front roof is a copper roof. This home is a historic home in an Architectural Review District. Our guidelines state repair versus replace or replacement in kind. The applicant is willing to replace the copper roof over the front porch with copper if the roof needs of replacement.

Rob DuBoff suggested that the applicant consider repair and repainting of the existing metal roof.

Discussion ensued among the Commission in terms of the roofing material for the remainder of the roof repair. Suggestions were made by the Commission to the applicant.
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Ellen Sheehan made a motion in the matter of the Peronto Exterior Modifications, 64 Van Dam Street that the application be approved with the following conditions – the applicant will repair or replace (if necessary) the copper roof over the porch. Pre-approval is granted for both a standing seam roof if the homeowner chooses to use metal, as well as an asphalt shingle roof. Leslie Mechem seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Rob DuBoff, in favor; Chris Bennett, in favor; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 6-0**

**NOTE:**
The agenda was heard out of order due to lack of representation for Agenda Item #3 and #4.

5. **20191095 LAPLANTE RESIDENCE EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 2 Wagner Road, Architectural Review of change in exterior materials (siding, awnings, roof extension, new rear deck) within the Urban Residential-1 District.

Applicant: Charles and Veronica LaPlante

The applicants are proposing exterior modifications to their home to approve the aesthetics. They are proposing gutters, vinyl siding in light grey or white, update the awnings in some areas and remove the awnings in other areas. A retractable awning is proposed for the area over the deck. We are also proposing a 10 x 10 pressure treated wood deck. The applicant provided photographs of the elevations of the home and the proposed materials.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman stated it is wonderful to see homeowners making such an investment into their home. This is in an Architectural Review District. All of these renovations are a huge improvement to the home.

Chris Bennett suggested the applicant explore underneath the current siding to see if wood siding is able to be restored. This would add more value to the home.

Rob DuBoff also concurred with Chris Bennett and suggested the applicant would be happier with wood siding and that any original wood trim should remain.

Discussion ensued among the Commission regarding the proposed renovations. It was the consensus of the Commission that the proposed renovations will greatly enhance the home. Suggestions were made by the Commission concerning vinyl siding and research different types. Suggest the applicant use the smooth side of the siding.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if anyone in the audience wished to comment on this application. None heard.

Leslie Mechem made a motion in the matter of the LaPlante Residence Exterior Modifications, 2 Wagner Road, that the application be approved with the following conditions. No J channels, no wood grain vinyl and corner boards. Ellen Sheehan seconded the motion.

Tamie Ehinger, Chairman asked if there was any further discussion. None heard.

**VOTE:**
Tamie Ehinger, Chairman, in favor; Karen Cavotta, Vice Chairman, Rob DuBoff, opposed; Chris Bennett, opposed; Leslie Mechem, in favor; Ellen Sheehan, in favor

**MOTION PASSES: 4-2**
The following applications were deferred to the next DRC meeting scheduled for December 11, 2019


4. **20191044 WEXLER EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS**, 179 Nelson Avenue, Historic Review of change in exterior materials (slate roof to asphalt shingles) within the Urban Residential-3 District.

**UPCOMING WORKSHOPS/MEETINGS:**
Design Review Commission Caravan, Tuesday, December 3, 2019 at 4:00 P.M.
Design Review Meeting, Wednesday, December 11, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN:**
There being no further business to discuss Tamie Ehinger, Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:10 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Buzanowski
Recording Secretary